



Minutes
Forsyth County
Historic Resources Commission
January 6, 2021
4:00 P.M.
City Hall Council Chamber, Room 230
101 North Main Street, Winston-Salem

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chad Gadberry, Ted Guenther, C.J. Idol, Kevin Owen, Janet Shill, Tina Thacker

MEMBERS ABSENT: Donna Abernethy, Emma Haney, Alanna Meltzer-Holderfield, LeAnn Pegram, Sunny Stewart

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland, Michelle McCullough, David Reed
Attorney Jerry Kontos

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of December 2, 2020 Minutes

Motion: Ms. Berry moved approval of the December 2, 2020 minutes.

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

- A. Frank Brown III, City of Winston-Salem
2163 and 2147 Bethabara Road, Winston-Salem
Bethabara Visitor's Center and Calf Barn
Bethabara Historic District #10N and #10P
Request: Install Signage
COA2021-001

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the work is not incongruous with the character of the Bethabara Historic District because:

- 1) The new signage will be 24" high x 36" wide x ½" thick, single sided, matte finished laminated panels made of custom high pressure laminate mounted on black, textured, power-coated metal pedestals. The signage is compatible with the District in terms of material, size, scale, typeface, and character. (*Signage*, Bethabara Guideline 2)
- 2) The new signage will be located at the Visitor's Center and the Calf Barn and will be in an appropriate location that does not diminish or compromise the historic character of the District.

The locations are not obtrusive and do not cover large portions of the building façade, any significant architectural features, or block streetscape views. (*Signage*, Bethabara Guideline 4)

- 3) The new signage is not attached to a building; it is installed into the ground and is removable. (*Signage*, Bethabara Guideline 5)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2021-001 at the Visitor's Center and the Calf Barn, located at 2163 and 2147 Bethabara Road, within the Bethabara Historic District (PINs 6817-78-0122.00 and 6817-77-2904.00) with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: None.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Findings of Fact

Ms. Thacker moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Bethabara Historic District because:

- 1) The new signage will be 24" high x 36" wide x ½" thick, single sided, matte finished laminated panels made of custom high pressure laminate mounted on black, textured, power-coated metal pedestals. The signage is compatible with the District in terms of material, size, scale, typeface, and character. (*Signage*, Bethabara Guideline 2)
- 2) The new signage will be located at the Visitor's Center and the Calf Barn and will be in an appropriate location that does not diminish or compromise the historic character of the District. The locations are not obtrusive and do not cover large portions of the building façade, any significant architectural features, or block streetscape views. (*Signage*, Bethabara Guideline 4)
- 3) The new signage is not attached to a building; it is installed into the ground and is removable. (*Signage*, Bethabara Guideline 5)

Second: Mr. Gadberry

Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Berry moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2021-001 at the Visitor's Center and the Calf Barn, located at 2163 and 2147 Bethabara Road, within the Bethabara Historic District (PINs 6817-78-0122.00 and 6817-77-2904.00) with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

B. Joe Williams
848 West Fifth Street, Winston-Salem
Rosenbacher House
Local Historic Landmark #106
West End Historic Overlay District #163
Request: Install Signage
COA2021-002

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the application is not incongruous with the character of the District and Landmark because:

- 1) The proposed project introduces one new freestanding sign, which is compatible with the landmark building, site, and District in terms of style, time-period, materials, design, size, scale, and color. The proposed project considers the style and size of the mounting apparatus. The proposed signage is a simple design made of wood (cedar) with two painted wood (cedar) posts with finial cut top. The signposts will be 4' 4" in height from ground level. The sign panel will be 6' wide x 2'4" high. (*Signage*, Landmark Guidelines 4 and 5 and *Signage*, West End Standards 1, 2, 5, 6 and 10)
- 2) The proposed project introduces new signage in a location that does not diminish or compromise the historic character of the landmark building or site. The sign is located on the front yard adjacent to the entrance steps in the terraced portion of the yard. The sign is below porch level and does not conceal significant architectural features or details. The new sign does not shadow or overpower adjacent structures. (*Signage*, Landmark Guideline 6 and *Signage*, West End Standards 2 and 3)
- 3) The proposed project introduces new signage that is removable. (*Signage*, Landmark Guideline 7 and *Signage*, West End Standard 4)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding comments, staff recommends that the Commission grant a COA for the installation of exterior signage at the Rosenbacher House, Local Historic Landmark #106, 848 West Fifth Street (PIN: 6825-87-9090.00), located in the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall remove the signage if the current businesses move out of the Rosenbacher House. When the sign is removed, the surface to which it was attached shall be repaired or restored to eliminate any evidence of the remove sign;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Keelyn Henderson, 401 Magnolia Branch Drive, Winston-Salem, NC, owner/manager of Board Babes, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application. John Merschel, 675 North Main Street, West End Association, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Findings of Fact

Ms. Shill moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Local Historic Landmark and the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The proposed project introduces one new freestanding sign, which is compatible with the landmark building, site, and District in terms of style, time-period, materials, design, size, scale, and color. The proposed project considers the style and size of the mounting apparatus. The proposed signage is a simple design made of wood (cedar) with two painted wood (cedar) posts with finial cut top. The signposts will be 4' 4" in height from ground level. The sign panel will be 6' wide x 2'4" high. (*Signage*, Landmark Guidelines 4 and 5 and *Signage*, West End Standards 1, 2, 5, 6 and 10)
- 2) The proposed project introduces new signage in a location that does not diminish or compromise the historic character of the landmark building or site. The sign is located on the front yard adjacent to the entrance steps in the terraced portion of the yard. The sign is below porch level and does not conceal significant architectural features or details. The new sign does not shadow or overpower adjacent structures. (*Signage*, Landmark Guideline 6 and *Signage*, West End Standards 2 and 3)

- 3) The proposed project introduces new signage that is removable. (*Signage*, Landmark Guideline 7 and *Signage*, West End Standard 4)

Second: Ms. Berry
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Idol moved that Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2021-002 at the Rosenbacher House, Local Historic Landmark #106, 848 West Fifth Street (PIN: 6825-87-9090.00), located in the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall remove the signage if the current businesses move out of the Rosenbacher House. When the sign is removed, the surface to which it was attached shall be repaired or restored to eliminate any evidence of the removed sign;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Guenther
Vote: Unanimous

III. MINOR WORK REPORT

IV. OTHER APPLICATIONS AND NOMINATIONS

- A. Request for City of Winston-Salem Historic Sign Classification
 1. Campus Gas
1231 Polo Road, Winston-Salem

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report.

To be classified as a Historic Sign, an application shall be filed with the Historic Resources Commission staff, and the Commission must find the following:

1. The sign bears a close resemblance to its appearance when originally installed;
2. The original sign was erected twenty-five (25) years prior to application for classification; and
3. The sign meets at least three (3) of the following criteria:
 - a. Bears a national or local emblem, logo, or other graphic that is unique to the property or the establishment, or that is a remnant of an advertising program that is no longer used by the parent company.
 - b. Is significant as reflecting the history of the building, structure, object, property or the development of the area, or recognized as important to the culture or history of Winston-Salem and Forsyth County.

- c. Possesses unique characteristics or incorporates materials, design or craftsmanship not commonly found in newer signs.
- d. Is unique, notably aesthetic or creative, so as to make a significant contribution as a work of art.
- e. Is recognized as a popular focal point within the community.
- f. Is associated with historical individuals, events or places.
- g. Is characteristic of a specific time period.
- h. Exhibits unique or rare characteristics that enhance the streetscape or the community at large.

Findings of Fact

With respect to the three (3) required findings of fact, staff has the following comments:

The sign bears a close resemblance to its appearance when originally installed;

Staff comments: The existing sign structure bears a close resemblance to the original sign structure.

The original sign was erected twenty-five (25) years prior to application for classification;

Staff comments: The existing sign structure was installed in 1965, fifty-five (55) years ago.

The sign meets at least three (3) of the criteria listed above;

Staff comments: The existing sign meets the following:

- *Is significant as reflecting the history of the building, structure, object, property or the development of the area, or recognized as important to the culture or history of Winston-Salem and Forsyth County.*
- *Possesses unique characteristics or incorporates materials, design or craftsmanship not commonly found in newer signs.*
- *Is recognized as a popular focal point within the community.*
- *Is associated with historical individuals, events or places.*
- *Is characteristic of a specific time period.*
- *Exhibits unique or rare characteristics that enhance the streetscape or the community at large.*

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of the classification of the Campus Gas sign, located at 1231 Polo Road, as a historic sign.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Ben Ingold, 8040 Glengarriff Road, Clemmons, NC, co-owner of Campus Gas, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that, pursuant to Section 6.5.1(F)(5) of the Unified Development Ordinances (“UDO”), the Campus Gas sign located at 1231 Polo Road meets all three (3) required findings of fact, as follows:

1. The sign bears a close resemblance to its appearance when originally installed;
2. The original sign was erected twenty-five (25) years prior to application for classification; and
3. The sign meets the following criteria:
 - a. Is significant as reflecting the history of the building, structure, object, property or the development of the area, or recognized as important to the culture or history of Winston-Salem and Forsyth County.
 - b. Possesses unique characteristics or incorporates materials, design or craftsmanship not commonly found in newer signs.
 - c. Is recognized as a popular focal point within the community.
 - d. Is associated with historical individuals, events or places.
 - e. Is characteristic of a specific time period.
 - f. Exhibits unique or rare characteristics that enhance the streetscape or the community at large.

SECOND: Ms. Berry
VOTE: Unanimous

Classification

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves application number HS2021-001, and grants the classification of the Campus Gas sign at 1231 Polo Road as a Historic Sign.

SECOND: Mr. Idol
VOTE: Unanimous

- B. Election of Officers will be held at the February 3, 2021 meeting

V. COMMITTEE REPORTS

A. Historic Marker Committee

Five markers have been approved for 2021, and draft marker texts done for three of those. The video for PH Hanes Knitting has been received from marketing and will be shared with the Committee and distributed on social media. The Y Camps marker video will also be shared on social media.

B. Education Committee – No new business

VI. STAFF REPORT

The application to designate the Bowman and Elizabeth Gray House as a Local Historic Landmark was approved by the County Commissioners in December 2020. The ordinance and has been recorded with the Register of Deed's Office.

St. Paul's Episcopal Church was listed in the National Register of Historic Places.

Janet Shill has been reappointed for her second term on the Commission.

An updated roster and calendar was placed at each of the Commission member's seats.

VII. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER

NEXT MEETING: February 3, 2021

This agenda is available in alternative media forms for people with disabilities. Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Historic Resources Commission are encouraged to contact the Planning Department at least 72 hours in advance so that proper accommodations can be arranged. For information, call 336-727-8000 (727-8319 TTY).