



Minutes
Forsyth County
Historic Resources Commission
February 3, 2021
4:00 P.M.
City Hall Council Chamber, Room 230
101 North Main Street, Winston-Salem

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chad Gadberry, Ted Guenther, Emma Haney, C.J. Idol, Kevin Owen, LeAnn Pegram, Janet Shill, Tina Thacker

MEMBERS ABSENT: Donna Abernethy, Alanna Meltzer-Holderfield, Sunny Stewart

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland, Michelle McCullough, David Reed
Attorney Jerry Kontos

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of January 6, 2021 Minutes

Motion: Ms. Thacker moved approval of the January 6, 2021 minutes.

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

A. Andrew Hobbs
914 Carolina Avenue, Winston-Salem
Claytie C. Harper House
West End Historic Overlay District #254
Request: After-the-fact grading and paving
COA2021-005

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to terrace the rear yard at the edge of the brick paver patio using two stone walls. The terraces navigate the change in grade between the lower elevation of the house and patio with the higher elevation of the parking pad and alley at the rear of the lot. The lower stone wall uses brick piers separated by sections of mortared stone, all capped with a masonry bench seat. Low landscape lighting is located under the seat and washes the lower wall. The upper wall is dry-stacked rock only. The new walls are compatible with the extant site topography and have no impact on historic site features. (*Retaining and Other Landscaping Walls*, West End Standards 5 and 9; *Exterior Lighting*, West End Standards 2 and 6)
- 2) Deteriorated wooden steps at the rear door of the house were replaced with cut stone steps. The wooden steps were not a component of a porch or other historic feature of the house. Rather, they sat

atop the brick patio. The dimensions of the new steps are appropriate, and they do not impact any historic features or the topography. (*Walkways and Steps*, West End Standard 7)

- 3) A slate pathway that was hazardous during rain was replaced with a new pathway of natural stepping stones that matches the stone steps in the rear yard. The dimensions of the walkway are appropriate for pedestrian use. The walkway navigates the extant topography and does not impact any historic site features. (*Walkways and Steps*, West End Standard 7)
- 4) The extant parking area was regraded and enlarged with respect to the width of the lot to address issues with water runoff and create a larger level area at the rear of the lot, adjacent to the alley. The parking area was covered with crusher run and Yadkin river pebble as a top coat. The expanded parking area did not impact any historic site features and had a minimal impact on the topography. It is located in an area of low visibility and is not visible from the public rights-of-way. (*Driveways and Parking Areas*, West End Standards 5 and 7)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2021-005 at the Claytie C. Harper House, located at 914 Carolina Avenue, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-77-8403.00).

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: None.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Findings of Fact

Ms. Thacker moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to terrace the rear yard at the edge of the brick paver patio using two stone walls. The terraces navigate the change in grade between the lower elevation of the house and patio with the higher elevation of the parking pad and alley at the rear of the lot. The lower stone wall uses brick piers separated by sections of mortared stone, all capped with a masonry bench seat. Low landscape lighting is located under the seat and washes the lower wall. The upper wall is dry-stacked rock only. The new walls are compatible with the extant site topography and have no impact on historic site features. (*Retaining and Other Landscaping Walls*, West End Standards 5 and 9; *Exterior Lighting*, West End Standards 2 and 6)
- 2) Deteriorated wooden steps at the rear door of the house were replaced with cut stone steps. The wooden steps were not a component of a porch or other historic feature of the house. Rather, they sat atop the brick patio. The dimensions of the new steps are appropriate, and they do not impact any historic features or the topography. (*Walkways and Steps*, West End Standard 7)
- 3) A slate pathway that was hazardous during rain was replaced with a new pathway of natural stepping stones that matches the stone steps in the rear yard. The dimensions of the walkway are appropriate for pedestrian use. The walkway navigates the extant topography and does not impact any historic site features. (*Walkways and Steps*, West End Standard 7)

- 4) The extant parking area was regraded and enlarged with respect to the width of the lot to address issues with water runoff and create a larger level area at the rear of the lot, adjacent to the alley. The parking area was covered with crusher run and Yadkin river pebble as a top coat. The expanded parking area did not impact any historic site features and had a minimal impact on the topography. It is located in an area of low visibility and is not visible from the public rights-of-way. (*Driveways and Parking Areas, West End Standards 5 and 7*)

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2021-005 at the Claytie C. Harper House, located at 914 Carolina Avenue, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-77-8403.00).

Second: Ms. Haney
Vote: Unanimous

- B. Jake Kennedy
1100 Block of West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem
Vacant Lot
West End Historic Overlay District #475
Request: New construction
COA2021-006

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The single family house is sited with a covered porch and single, central entrance facing West Fourth Street. It is located in the center of the lot with a standard setback. These aspects of its siting are consistent with the lot development pattern along West Fourth Street. A one-car wide, gravel driveway will lead straight to the rear of the lot, where a gravel parking pad will be located directly behind the house in an area of low visibility. The lot slopes down toward the rear, which will be addressed with a taller foundation toward the rear of the house, rather than significant grading. (*New Construction, West End Standards 1-3; Driveways and Parking Areas, West End Standards 4-7*)
- 2) The one and one-half story, three bay house has a large gable end dormer with a tripartite window in the center of the roof. The Craftsman bungalow is consistent with West Fourth Street's contributing buildings in terms of its height, form, size, scale, massing, proportion, and roof form. Its simple form, size, scale, and proportions are similar to other Craftsman buildings on the block. Side gable roofs and large dormers are found commonly throughout the West End, as are exposed rafter tails. The use of historic forms and details is compatible with the District, while the use of modern materials differentiates the building as a new feature. (*New Construction, West End Standards 4 and 8*)
- 3) A screened porch constructed with a pressure-treated deck elevated on pressure-treated posts, simple wood picket railings, and a pressure-treated stair providing access to the rear yard will be located in an area of low visibility. It will have an end gable roof with exposed rafter tails. (*New Construction, West End Standards 9*)

- 4) The two-panel door with three lights and the three-over-one, simulated divided light aluminum-clad wood windows with permanently applied exterior muntins are compatible in material, proportion, pattern, and detail with the windows and doors of contributing buildings in the West End. The symmetrical fenestration pattern on the street façade also follows traditional Craftsman patterns in terms of spacing, placement, scale, orientation, proportion, and size. The single-car carriage-style overhead garage door will be constructed of steel. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 5 and 6)
- 5) The roof will be clad with black architectural shingles. The walls will be clad with smooth-finished HardiePlank lap siding. The foundation will be clad with standard modular bricks. Porch columns will be wood on top of brick piers. The materials and finishes are consistent with surrounding buildings in composition, scale, module, pattern, detail, texture, and finish. (*New Construction*, West End Standard 7)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2021-006 at the vacant lot located in the 1100 block of West Fourth Street (odd side), within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-75-7070.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the *Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work* and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Jake Kennedy, 4855 Hawkwood Trail, Winston-Salem, NC, owner, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: John Merschel, 675 North Main Street, Winston-Salem, NC, West End Association, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in opposition to the application. Jim Taber, 1203 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem, NC, neighbor, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in opposition to the application.

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Findings of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that based on the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The single family house is sited with a covered porch and single, central entrance facing West Fourth Street. It is located in the center of the lot with a standard setback. These aspects of its siting are consistent with the lot development pattern along West Fourth Street. A one-car wide, gravel driveway will lead straight to the rear of the lot, where a gravel parking pad will be located directly behind the house in an area of low visibility. The lot slopes down toward the rear, which will be addressed with a

taller foundation toward the rear of the house, rather than significant grading. (*New Construction, West End Standards 1-3; Driveways and Parking Areas, West End Standards 4-7*)

- 2) The one and one-half story, three bay house has a large gable end dormer with a tripartite window in the center of the roof. The Craftsman bungalow is consistent with West Fourth Street's contributing buildings in terms of its height, form, size, scale, massing, proportion, and roof form. Its simple form, size, scale, and proportions are similar to other Craftsman buildings on the block. Side gable roofs and large dormers are found commonly throughout the West End, as are exposed rafter tails. The use of historic forms and details is compatible with the District, while the use of modern materials differentiates the building as a new feature. (*New Construction, West End Standards 4 and 8*)
- 3) A screened porch constructed with a pressure-treated deck elevated on pressure-treated posts, with simple picket railings and a pressure-treated stair providing access to the rear yard, will be located in an area of low visibility. It will have an end gable roof with exposed rafter tails. (*New Construction, West End Standards 9*)
- 4) The two-panel door with three lights and the three-over-one, simulated divided light aluminum-clad wood windows with permanently applied exterior muntins are compatible in material, proportion, pattern, and detail with the windows and doors of contributing buildings in the West End. The symmetrical fenestration pattern on the street façade also follows traditional Craftsman patterns in terms of spacing, placement, scale, orientation, proportion, and size. The single-car carriage-style overhead garage door will be constructed of steel. (*New Construction, West End Standards 5 and 6*)
- 5) The roof will be clad with black architectural shingles. The walls will be clad with smooth-finished HardiePlank lap siding. The foundation will be clad with standard modular bricks. Porch columns will be wood on top of brick piers. The materials and finishes are consistent with surrounding buildings in composition, scale, module, pattern, detail, texture, and finish. (*New Construction, West End Standard 7*)

Second: Ms. Shill

Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Haney moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2021-006 at the vacant lot, located in the 1100 block of West Fourth Street (odd side), within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-75-7070.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

III. **MINOR WORK REPORT**

IV. OTHER APPLICATIONS AND NOMINATIONS

V. COMMITTEE REPORTS

A. Historic Marker Committee

1. Peter Clemmons House marker text

Peter and Comfort Clemmons House

Home of the Village namesake; built ca. 1805 and expanded ca. 1850. Features late Georgian and early Federal architectural elements. Used as a boarding house, general store, inn, and stagecoach stop in the 19th century. Sold to Henry W. Fries in 1868. Bought by J.P. Sprinkle in 1903; owned by Sprinkle-Ogburn family until 2020.

2. Oak Crest Historic District marker text

Oak Crest Historic District

Oak Crest was first platted in 1923 by John, Francis, and Henry Fries and expanded in 1937 by J.A. and H.A. Nading. With curving streets and wooded lots ranging from small to urban-farm sized, the middle-income neighborhood mixes modest Craftsman, Colonial Revival, and Ranch houses with Revival-style Cottages, all built between 1925 and 1968. Residents included educators, accountants, florists, and nurses, as well as employees of R. J. Reynolds Tobacco Company, Hanes Knitting, Hanes Hosiery, Pilot Freight Carriers, and Western Electric. The Modernist College 66 Service Station, built in 1965, is the only commercial building in Oak Crest.

3. Reynolda Park marker text

Reynolda Park

Reynolda Park was developed by Katharine Smith Reynolds Johnston in the 1920s on a 65-acre tract partitioned from Reynolda Estate. The innovative park-like neighborhood was designed by landscape architect Thomas W. Sears and showcases houses designed by noted architects, including Charles Barton Keen and Luther Lashmit.

4. Winston-Salem Rescue Squad marker text

Winston-Salem Rescue Squad

In 1937, Roy Kane and Thurmond Chatham founded the volunteer Winston-Salem Rescue Squad, the first such agency in North Carolina. It became a model for rescue squads in the Southeast. The Squad responded to such emergencies as traffic accidents and drownings. It provided ambulance service and was a rescue resource, using one of the state's first "Jaws of Life" tools. The agency was a source of durable medical equipment such as oxygen tanks and hospital beds, even providing iron lungs for polio treatment. The Squad was merged into Forsyth County EMS in 2009 and eventually disbanded in 2013.

5. Stroble's Stone House farm marker text

Donald and Virginia Stroble Farm

The Strobles built their house in 1937, using stone from the farm's fields. Don Stroble, known as the "Mayor of Pfafftown," worked at the *Winston-Salem Journal and Sentinel* until his death in 1942. Virginia Stroble raised their five children and fostered over one hundred other children through the Forsyth County Welfare Department, many of whom had special needs. She was a member of the National Rose Society and other garden clubs. The property was owned by the Stroble family until 2001. The small farm retains its original outbuildings, including a greenhouse, horse barn, pig pen, and chicken coop.

MOTION: Ms. Pegram moved approval of the marker inscriptions as presented by staff and revised by the Commission.

SECOND: Ms. Berry

VOTE: Unanimous

B. Education Committee

VI. ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Chair

Motion: Ms. Thacker nominated Mr. Owen as Chair.

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

Vice-Chair

Motion: Ms. Shill nominated Ms. Berry as Vice-Chair.

Second: Ms. Thacker

Vote: Unanimous

VII. STAFF REPORT

February is Black History Month and Heather has been working on a great collection of histories related to African Americans in medical history. You can find these posts on the City's social media sites. Please become friends with the City so you can like and share.

VIII. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER

NEXT MEETING: March 3, 2021

This agenda is available in alternative media forms for people with disabilities. Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Historic Resources Commission are encouraged to contact the Planning Department at least 72 hours in advance so that proper accommodations can be arranged. For information, call 336-727-8000 (727-8319 TTY).