



**Minutes**  
**Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission**  
**March 2, 2022**  
**4:00 p.m.**  
**City Hall**  
**Council Chamber, Room 230**  
**101 N. Main Street, Winston-Salem**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chair; CJ Idol, Vice-Chair; Scott Binkley; Chad Gadberry; Emma Haney; Veronica Kromm; LeAnn Pegram; Noah Reynolds; Janet Shill; Tina Thacker

MEMBERS ABSENT: Edwin Bouldin; Sunny Stewart

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland; Michelle McCullough; David Reed  
Deputy City Attorney Jerry Kontos

## **I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

### A. Approval of January 5, 2022 Minutes

MOTION by Mr. Idol to approve the January 5, 2022, minutes.  
Second by Ms. Shill.  
Vote: Unanimous

### B. Approval of February 2, 2022 Minutes

MOTION by Ms. Pegram to approve the February 2, 2022, minutes.  
Second by Mr. Idol.  
Vote: Unanimous

## **II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS**

- A. Hayes Wauford, Wilson-Covington  
914 West End Boulevard, Winston-Salem  
Dr. Eugene P. Gray House  
West End Historic Overlay District #383  
**Request: Construction of an outbuilding**  
**COA2022-010**

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

### Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The proposed outbuilding will be located at the rear of the lot, adjacent to the alley. This is an area of low visibility that is consistent with the historic relationship of garages and outbuildings to the house and the site. The footprint of the outbuilding is substantially smaller than the footprint of the house, and it does not significantly reduce the open space of the existing lot. The peak of the roof is 16' 1" above grade, with a partial basement below grade, which is lower than the 2 ½ story high roofline of the house.

(*Garages and Accessory Buildings*, West End Standards 1 and 4; *New Construction*, West End Standards 1 and 4)

- 2) Construction of the proposed outbuilding will maintain the tiered topography of the site, where the alley is at 880', sitting 14' higher than the house at 866'. Construction will not impact any character-defining site features or significant West End vistas or views. Disturbance of the terrain will be minimized by the use of a partial, rather than full, basement. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 2 and 3)
- 3) The proposed outbuilding is compatible with surrounding outbuildings in terms of its basic cubic form with rectilinear extension, human-scaled proportions, and hipped and gable roof forms. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 2 and 3)
- 4) The centered and paired 6-over-1 double-hung windows; paired, solid-wood paneled doors; and single 4-light casement window are compatible with fenestration found on contributing buildings in the West End in terms of spacing, placement, scale, orientation, proportion, and size. The aluminum clad windows will have simulated, divided-light upper sashes with spacer bars between the glass; muntin size will match the windows on the house. The doors and windows are compatible with the house and contributing West End buildings in terms of material, proportion, pattern, and detail. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 5 and 6)
- 5) The brick foundation and basement walls will be constructed from a blend of Old Carolina brick to match the foundation of the house. The upper walls will be clad with painted, smooth-finished Hardie Plank lap siding with a 5" exposure to match the house. The roof will be clad with architectural shingles to match the house. The posts, trim, and lattice will be painted, millable PVC with a smooth finish to match the profiles and dimensions of the trim on the house. The pent roof over the basement doors will be finished with wooden brackets and exposed wooden rafters with tails, a detail common to Craftsman buildings in the West End. The open carport ceiling will be painted, tongue-and-groove beadboard, a traditional porch ceiling treatment found throughout the West End. The metal and glass, Craftsman-style light fixtures are consistent with fixtures found on contributing buildings in the West End. The materials and finishes for the proposed outbuilding are compatible with the special character of the West End in terms of scale, module, pattern, detail, texture, and finish. However, the modern composition of the materials will differentiate the proposed outbuilding from original outbuildings in the West End. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 7 and 8)
- 6) Two new stairways will navigate the slope from the carport down to the basement, and then to the rear yard. The proposed stairways will be constructed of concrete with concrete sidewalls. A simple painted metal railing will be located to one side of the longer stair run. The stairs are scaled to the size of the carport and follow the natural topography; neither the stairs nor the railing will have an impact on any historic site features. (*Walkways and Steps*, West End Standard 7; *Railings in the Landscape*, West End Standard 3)
- 7) A 2'-high brick retaining wall will allow for the creation of a flat area approximately 4' deep in front of the doors to the basement of the outbuilding. The wall will have a minimal impact on the site topography and will not impact any historic site features. It is compatible with the site in setback, size, height, and scale. (*Retaining and Other Landscaping Walls*, West End Standards 5 and 9)

#### Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-010 at the Dr. Eugene P. Gray House, located at 914 West End Boulevard (PIN 6825-75-2421), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

### Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Applicant Hayes Wauford, Executive Vice President of Wilson-Covington Construction Co., 2700 Boulder Park Court, Winston-Salem, NC was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Property owner Jennifer DiEduardo, 914 West End Boulevard, Winston-Salem, NC was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

### Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

### Commission Findings of Fact

Ms. Thacker moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The proposed outbuilding will be located at the rear of the lot, adjacent to the alley. This is an area of low visibility that is consistent with the historic relationship of garages and outbuildings to the house and the site. The footprint of the outbuilding is substantially smaller than the footprint of the house, and it does not significantly reduce the open space of the existing lot. The peak of the roof is 16' 1" above grade, with a partial basement below grade, which is lower than the 2 ½ story high roofline of the house. (*Garages and Accessory Buildings*, West End Standards 1 and 4; *New Construction*, West End Standards 1 and 4)
- 2) Construction of the proposed outbuilding will maintain the tiered topography of the site, where the alley is at 880', sitting 14' higher than the house at 866'. Construction will not impact any character-defining site features or significant West End vistas or views. Disturbance of the terrain will be minimized by the use of a partial, rather than full, basement. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 2 and 3)
- 3) The proposed outbuilding is compatible with surrounding outbuildings in terms of its basic cubic form with rectilinear extension, human-scaled proportions, and hipped and gable roof forms. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 2 and 3)
- 4) The centered and paired 6-over-1 double-hung windows; paired, solid-wood paneled doors; and single 4-light casement window are compatible with fenestration found on contributing buildings in the West End in terms of spacing, placement, scale, orientation, proportion, and size. The aluminum clad windows will have simulated, divided-light upper sashes with spacer bars between the glass; muntin size will match the windows on the house. The doors and windows are compatible with the house and contributing West End buildings in terms of material, proportion, pattern, and detail. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 5 and 6)
- 5) The brick foundation and basement walls will be constructed from a blend of Old Carolina brick to match the foundation of the house. The upper walls will be clad with painted, smooth-finished Hardie Plank lap siding with a 5" exposure to match the house. The roof will be clad with architectural shingles to match the house. The posts, trim, and lattice will be painted, millable PVC with a smooth finish to match the profiles and dimensions of the trim on the house. The pent roof over the basement doors will be finished with wooden brackets and exposed wooden rafters with tails, a detail common to Craftsman buildings in the West End. The open carport ceiling will be painted, tongue-and-groove beadboard, a traditional porch

ceiling treatment found throughout the West End. The metal and glass, Craftsman-style light fixtures are consistent with fixtures found on contributing buildings in the West End. The materials and finishes for the proposed outbuilding are compatible with the special character of the West End in terms of scale, module, pattern, detail, texture, and finish. However, the modern composition of the materials will differentiate the proposed outbuilding from original outbuildings in the West End. (*New Construction, West End Standards 7 and 8*)

- 6) Two new stairways will navigate the slope from the carport down to the basement, and then to the rear yard. The proposed stairways will be constructed of concrete with concrete sidewalls. A simple painted metal railing will be located to one side of the longer stair run. The stairs are scaled to the size of the carport and follow the natural topography; neither the stairs nor the railing will have an impact on any historic site features. (*Walkways and Steps, West End Standard 7; Railings in the Landscape, West End Standard 3*)
- 7) A 2'-high brick retaining wall will allow for the creation of a flat area approximately 4' deep in front of the doors to the basement of the outbuilding. The wall will have a minimal impact on the site topography and will not impact any historic site features. It is compatible with the site in setback, size, height, and scale. (*Retaining and Other Landscaping Walls, West End Standards 5 and 9*)

Second: Ms. Shill  
Vote: Unanimous

#### Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Idol moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2022-010 at the Dr. Eugene P. Gray House, located at 914 West End Boulevard (PIN 6825-75-2421), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Haney  
Vote: Unanimous

### **III. MINOR WORK REPORT**

No comments or questions on the Minor Work Report.

### **IV. OTHER NOMINATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS**

#### **A. Section 106 Consultation Cleveland Avenue Homes (FY9238) Demolition**

Ms. McCullough introduced Ms. Debbie Bevin of Richard Grubb & Associates, the Section 106 consultant hired by the developer for the Cleveland Avenue Homes CNI project. Ms. Bevin explained the basics of the Section 106 consultation process and the Commission's role in that process. She then introduced Olivia Heckendorf who reviewed the history of housing segregation and public housing in Winston-Salem generally, and the Cleveland Avenue Homes specifically. Sandra Seals, a Senior Vice President for the developer, McCormack Baron Salazar, reviewed the history of the CNI project, community engagement, and the development timeline. Ms. McCullough presented staff suggestions for mitigation of the demolition of Cleveland Avenue Homes,

which has been determined eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. The Commission discussed the ideas and added items to the list. The following list of suggested mitigation measures will be provided to the SHPO and developer.

1. The developer will engage a cultural resources firm to coordinate and complete an architectural and historical survey and report on the Winston-Salem Urban Renewal/African American housing and businesses areas, including a context for African American housing from the founding of R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Company in 1875 until 1975. The project will include the items below and should be completed within two (2) years of the execution of this agreement.
  - A. A cultural resources consultant to update the African American architectural Survey completed in 1991 to meet current North Carolina State Historic Preservation Office survey standards and process requirements. This survey would be developed upon existing surveys, studies, and histories including but not limited to:
    - a. *Winston-Salem's African American Neighborhoods: 1870-1950* by Langdon Oppermann - 1993
    - b. *Winston-Salem's Architectural Heritage* by Heather Fearnbach – 2015
    - c. *Frontier to Factory* by Gwynne Taylor – 1981
    - d. *Forsyth: The History of a County on the March* by Adelaide Fries, Stuart Thurman Wright, and J. Edwin Hendricks – 1949, 1976
  - B. A genealogical consultant to conduct additional historical research aimed at identifying past occupants of Cleveland Avenue Homes and the neighborhoods that preceded it east of Main Street, along with residents of Winston-Salem's other public housing projects: Happy Hill Gardens, Kimberly Park Terrace, and Piedmont Park. Oral histories will be collected from identified residents or descendants of families who lived through this period of time, if possible. Electronic audio and/or video recordings and transcriptions of all completed oral histories will be coordinated by and curated with Central Library of Winston-Salem or another designated local repository, such as the Winston-Salem State University Archives and Collections.
  - C. An archivist/curator to compile, digitize, and catalog a digital posts-New Deal Winston-Salem research file to be housed at the Forsyth County Central Library - North Carolina Collection, DigitalNC, and the Winston-Salem/Forsyth County Planning and Development Services Department. This file will document the impact of post-New Deal federal legislation on Winston-Salem and Forsyth County, including, but not limited to, the construction of interstate highways, public housing, and urban renewal. The file would include documents, including but not limited to reports, photos, maps, illustrations, etc., that are currently located at but not limited to the following locations:
    - A. Housing Authority of Winston-Salem (HAWS)
    - B. Winston-Salem/Forsyth County Planning and Development Services Department
    - C. City of Winston-Salem Community Development Department
    - D. City of Winston-Salem Board of Aldermen/City Council records
    - E. Forsyth County Board of Commissioners records
    - F. Forsyth County Central Library - North Carolina Collection
    - G. Housing and Urban Development Department (HUD)
    - H. North Carolina Department of Transportation (NCDOT)
    - I. Federal Highway Administration (FHA)
    - J. Any other local, state, and federal repository that may have resources to include in the file.
  - D. A designer to create a story map/web page based on information in the research file that will be housed and maintained by a designated local repository, such as the Winston-Salem State University Archives and Collections.

2. Consider using the “Cleveland Avenue Homes,” or some component thereof, in the new housing name.
3. Engage an archeologist to observe and document the Cleveland Avenue Homes Site while the buildings are demolished and during grading and while doing any site work. Even though we associate the 20th century with being very well documented, the material culture present would give us some insight into the day to day lives of the people who lived in this neighborhood, which would not be present in any written documents. With this era drawing increasing interests from the academic community, archaeology has also become increasingly interested.
4. Construct onsite some form of a physical and/or educational remembrance to the history of the area and the people that once lived there. The object would link the past to the present. The community should be included in the planning and selecting the final form and design, whether it be a sign, public art, or another creative form of remembrance.

## V. COMMITTEE REPORTS

A. Chair Berry appointed Mr. Reynolds and Mr. Idol to the Historic Marker Committee.

B. Historic Marker Committee

1. Alta Vista Historic Marker

a. Text discussion and approval

Ms. Bratland presented the revised Alta Vista marker text. Ms. Pegram, chair of the Historic Marker Committee, moved approval of the revised text.

Second: Ms. Thacker

Vote: Unanimous

2. St. Philips Moravian Church Origin 1822

a. Unveiling planned for April 30 at 3:00 pm

Chair Berry volunteered to be the HRC speaker at the marker unveiling. Ms. Shill, Ms. Pegram, Ms. Thacker, Mr. Idol, and Ms. Haney volunteered to attend the marker unveiling and assist with hosting the event.

C. Education Committee

## VI. STAFF REPORT

A. 2022 CLG Grant Applications due April 22, 2022

Ms. McCullough reviewed the 2021 CLG Grant Applications that are underway. She presented staff's suggestion to apply for a 2022 CLG Grant to hire a consultant to draft revised Old Salem Historic Design Review Standards. The Commission discussed the proposed application. Mr. Idol moved approval for the Commission to apply for a 2022 CLG Grant to hire a consultant to draft revised Old Salem Historic District Design Review Standards.

Second: Ms. Thacker

Vote: Unanimous

B. Black History Month

Ms. Bratland presented the social media posts re. lost neighborhoods that staff shared on the City of Winston-Salem social medial channels during Black History Month.

## VII. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER