



Minutes
Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission
April 6, 2022
4:00 p.m.
City Hall
Council Chamber, Room 230
101 N. Main Street, Winston-Salem

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chair; CJ Idol, Vice-Chair; Scott Binkley; Edwin Bouldin; Chad Gadberry; Veronica Kromm; Janet Shill

MEMBERS ABSENT: Emma Haney; LeAnn Pegram; Noah Reynolds; Sunny Stewart; Tina Thacker

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland; Michelle McCullough
Deputy City Attorney Jerry Kontos

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of March 2, 2022 Minutes

MOTION by Ms. Shill to approve the March 2, 2022, minutes.

Second by Mr. Idol.

Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

- A. Chara Murray
510 Salisbury Street, Kernersville
Isaac Harrison McKaughan House
Local Historic Landmark #83
Request: After-the-fact replacement of wood siding on addition
COA2022-017

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the plywood with 1"x 8" wood clapboards. The addition is not original to the building, and the plywood cladding material does not contribute to the overall character of the building. The plywood cladding was deteriorated, and the proposed wooden clapboards are compatible with, but differentiated from, the historic building in material, size, scale, finish, and detail. (Wood, Landmark Standards 1 and 6-8)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-017 at the Isaac Harrison McKaughan House, Local Historic Landmark #83, located at 510 Salisbury Street, Kernersville, (PIN 6886-12-5099) with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: None

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Ms. Shill moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the plywood with 1"x 8" wood clapboards. The addition is not original to the building, and the plywood cladding material does not contribute to the overall character of the building. The plywood cladding was deteriorated, and the proposed wooden clapboards are compatible with, but differentiated from, the historic building in material, size, scale, finish, and detail. (Wood, Landmark Standards 1 and 6-8)

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Idol moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission approves COA2022-017 at the Isaac Harrison McKaughan House, Local Historic Landmark #83, located at 510 Salisbury Street, Kernersville, (PIN 6886-12-5099) with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

B. Teresa Blackburn, TB Realty Team
860-862 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem
Commercial-Apartment Building
West End Historic Overlay District #146
Request: Installation of signage
COA2022-018

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to hang a 16" x 23" sign at the bottom of the existing projecting sign. The new panel will be made from wood and covered with a vinyl overlay. The sign will have a white background with the TB Realty Team logo in the center. It will be connected to the panel above with metal S hooks and use the existing mounting apparatus. The sign is compatible with the size, scale, and design of the building. It will not conceal, obscure, damage, or destroy any architectural details or features, and it will not block streetscape views. The sign will not shadow or overpower adjacent structures; it is removable. The sign is constructed from wood with an overlay of study contemporary material. The projecting sign is limited in number and scale. (Signage, West End Standards 1-5, 12, 16)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-018 at the Commercial-Apartment Building, located at 860-862 West Fourth Street (PIN 6825-86-8573), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: None

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to hang a 16" x 23" sign at the bottom of the existing projecting sign. The new panel will be made from wood and covered with a vinyl overlay. The sign will have a white background with the TB Realty Team logo in the center. It will be connected to the panel above with metal S hooks and use the existing mounting apparatus. The sign is compatible with the size, scale, and design of the building. It will not conceal, obscure, damage, or destroy any architectural details or features, and it will not block streetscape views. The sign will not shadow or overpower adjacent structures; it is removable. The sign is constructed from wood with an overlay of study contemporary material. The projecting sign is limited in number and scale. (Signage, West End Standards 1-5, 12, 16)

Second: Mr. Binkley
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission approves COA2022-018 at the Commercial-Apartment Building, located at 860-862 West Fourth Street (PIN 6825-86-8573), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

C. Rusty Carringer, Crown Castle
Right-of-way at Shamrock and West Fourth Streets, Winston-Salem
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: Installation of a utility pole and antenna
COA2022-019

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the existing utility pole at the corner of Shamrock and West Fourth Streets with a new utility pole capped with a concealed poletop antenna. The existing pole is 23' 6" high, and the new pole and antenna will be 37' high. The antenna will include two 4" x 6" RF (radio frequency) information signs with a gray shroud. The pole will include an electric meter, a Crown Castle marketing sign, and the Crown Castle blue marketing sign at eye level. Both signs are 4" x 6" in size. The taller utility pole will not impact the topography, street patterns, dimensions of the rights-of-way, granite curbing, or the sidewalks. The proposed utility pole is not incongruous with the historic character of the West End, in which the streetscape includes above ground utilities and wires. The signage that will be installed on the pole is required by law. It is small in scale and will not block streetscape views. (*Public Rights-of-way*, West End Standards 1 and 7; *Signage*, West End Standard 16)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-019 in the right-of-way located at Shamrock and West Fourth Streets, within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Rusty Carringer, Crown Castle, 6325 Ardrey Kell Road, Suite 600, Charlotte, NC 28277, Applicant, appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application. Jordan Peters, Crown Castle, 6325 Ardrey Kell Road, Suite 600, Charlotte, NC 28277, appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Ms. Shill moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the existing utility pole at the corner of Shamrock and West Fourth Streets with a new utility pole capped with a concealed poletop antenna. The existing pole is 23' 6" high, and the new pole and antenna will be 37' high. The antenna will include two 4" x 6" RF (radio frequency) information signs with a gray shroud. The pole will include an electric meter, a Crown Castle marketing sign, and the Crown Castle blue marketing sign at eye level. Both signs are 4" x 6" in size. The taller utility pole will not impact the topography, street patterns, dimensions of the rights-of-way, granite curbing, or the sidewalks. The proposed utility pole is not incongruous with the historic character of the West End, in which the streetscape includes above ground utilities and wires. The signage that will be installed on the pole is required by law. It is small in scale and will not block streetscape views. (*Public Rights-of-way, West End Standards 1 and 7; Signage, West End Standard 16*)

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Gadberry moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission approves COA2022-019 in the right-of-way located at Shamrock and West Fourth Streets, within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Kromm
Vote: Unanimous

D. Teresa Grossi
1001 West Fifth Street, Winston-Salem
James S. Easley House
West End Historic Overlay District #183
Request: Replacement of the porch columns
COA2022-020

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the modern wooden columns with new composite columns. The existing wooden replacement columns use modern carpentry techniques and have very little paint build up, evidence of post-1980 installation. They have already begun to rot and decay at the bases where they absorb water from the porch floor. This is an inherent flaw in the design of the porch, which situates the column bases close to the edge of the porch in an exposed area. The pine replacement columns available today are not the same quality as historic wood, which has a much tighter grain and is more rot resistant. The applicant has demonstrated that it is not feasible to replace the columns in-kind because of inherent flaws in the original materials or design and the unavailability of historic materials. Composite is an appropriate substitute material that will convey the same appearance as wooden columns. The composite columns will be turned, which is the style of column documented in the narrative description for the James S. Easley House. The applicant will reinstall the historic wooden brackets after replacing the columns. (*Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Standards 1, 2, 4, and 5; *Glossary*, West End Standards: Feasibility)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-020 at the James S. Easley House located at 1001 West Fifth Street (PIN 6825-86-1766), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: None

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the modern wooden columns with new composite columns. The existing wooden replacement columns use modern carpentry techniques and have very little paint build up, evidence of post-1980 installation. They have already begun to rot and decay at the bases where they absorb water from the porch floor. This is an inherent flaw in the design of the porch, which situates the column bases close to the edge of the porch in an exposed area. The pine replacement columns available today are not the same quality as historic wood, which has a much tighter grain and is more rot resistant. The applicant has demonstrated that it is not feasible to replace the columns in-kind because of inherent flaws in the original materials or design and the unavailability of historic materials. Composite is an appropriate substitute material that will convey the same appearance as wooden columns. The composite columns will be turned, which is the style of column documented in the narrative description for the James S. Easley House. The applicant will reinstall the historic wooden brackets after replacing the columns. (*Entrances, Porches, Enclosures, and Balconies*, West End Standards 1, 2, 4, and 5; *Glossary*, West End Standards: Feasibility)

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Kromm moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission approves COA2022-020 at the James S. Easley House located at 1001 West Fifth Street (PIN 6825-86-1766), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Gadberry
Vote: Unanimous

III. MINOR WORK REPORT

No comments or questions on the Minor Work Report.

IV. OTHER NOMINATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

V. COMMITTEE REPORTS

A. Historic Marker Committee

1. Alta Vista Historic Marker
 - a. Text discussion and approval

Ms. Bratland presented revised Alta Vista marker text. Mr. Idol, a member of the Historic Marker Committee, moved approval of the revised text.

Second: Mr. Gadberry

Vote: Unanimous

2. St. Philips Moravian Church Origin 1822
 - a. Unveiling planned for April 30 at 3:00 p.m.

Ms. Shill noted that she would be unable to attend the unveiling.

3. Winston-Salem Rescue Squad
Unveiling planned for April 23 at 10:00 a.m.

Ms. Shill volunteered to the HRC speaker. Chair Berry volunteered to assist with unveiling.

B. Education Committee

VI. STAFF REPORT

- A. Commission retreat scheduled for July 27, 12:00-5:00 p.m.
- B. Local Historic Landmark information update letters sent out
- C. Winston Lake Golf Course National Register Nomination Project Update

Winston-Lake Golf Course has been entered into the NC Study List for the National Register. The City is proceeding with a contract to nominate the course to the National Register of Historic Places.

D. Preservation North Carolina Awards Proposed

Ms. McCullough noted that staff planned to nominate the Union Station rehabilitation project for a Gertrude S. Carraway Award of Merit and the ongoing recovery of Odd Fellows Cemetery for a Minnette C. Duffy Landscape Preservation Award. Both properties are local historic landmarks. The Commission expressed their support for the nominations.

E. Annual Report

Ms. McCullough noted that the HRC's 2021 Annual Report will be distributed to local elected officials throughout Forsyth County during April.

F. *Great Houses and their Stories* by Peggy Smith

Ms. McCullough informed the Commission that there would be an event at Bookmarks to launch the book on May 19.

G. Modernist Winston-Salem Tour

NCModernist is hosting a tour of private homes in the Triad on June 4. Attendees may join at SECCA for a reduced rate of \$99.

H. Potential CLG Grant Application for Cemetery Mapping Project

Ms. McCullough updated the Commission on a potential CLG Grant Application from Terry Brock, an archaeologist based at Wake Forest University, and Preservation Forsyth. This grant would be for an amount

of \$5,000 and would provide funds to digitize and geo-reference historical maps in the Planning Division collection to establish locations for historic cemeteries in Forsyth County.

Mr. Idol moved approval of the proposed CLG grant application.

Second: Ms. Shill

Vote: Unanimous

VII. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER