



Minutes
Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission
May 4, 2022
4:00 p.m.
City Hall
Council Chamber, Room 230
101 N. Main Street, Winston-Salem

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chair; CJ Idol, Vice-Chair; Scott Binkley; Chad Gadberry; Emma Haney; LeAnn Pegram; Noah Reynolds; Janet Shill; Tina Thacker

MEMBERS ABSENT: Edwin Bouldin; Veronica Kromm; Sunny Stewart

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland; Michelle McCullough; David Reed
Deputy City Attorney Jerry Kontos

Mayor Pro Tempore and North Ward Council Member D.D. Adams thanked the Commission for their volunteer work and dedication to preserving and celebrating the city's historic resources, especially through its marker program.

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of April 6, 2022 Minutes

MOTION by Ms. Shill to approve the April 6, 2022, minutes.
Second by Ms. Haney.
Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

A. Adam Spear, Applicant
102 South Cherry Street, Winston-Salem
Rogers House
Local Historic Landmark #40
Request: Construction of an outbuilding
COA2022-021

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

- 1) The proposed outbuilding will be located at the rear of the lot in a traditional location for outbuildings on this block and site. It is, therefore, compatible with the visual and spatial character of the Landmark's setting. The proposed outbuilding is sited at the rear corner of the property, adjacent to First and Marshall Streets. It is set back from the primary structure's facade along Cherry Street with its main facade oriented south. The 1917 Sanborn Fire Insurance Company map shows two outbuildings adjacent to Marshall Street on this lot, one in the location of the proposed outbuilding. The new construction will not diminish or compromise the character of the Landmark building at this location and conforms to the historic patterns of building setbacks and spacing. The size and the orientation of the proposed building is not consistent with other historical outbuildings, however, no significant site features will be lost with the construction of this outbuilding. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standards 1-3; *Outbuildings and Garages*, Landmark Standards 8-10; *Setting*, Landmark Standard 3)
- 2) The proposed building is one-story, 28' high at its highest, 65' long x 34' wide. Although the building footprint is large, it is a single story, and it does not overpower the Landmark building. There will be less green space in the rear yard. However, the yard was not noted as having any significant features in the Landmark application and report. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standard 4; *Outbuildings and Garages*, Landmark Standard 11)
- 3) Most homes in the downtown had rear yard outbuildings, which were utilitarian in nature and simple in design and shape. Many did not mimic the style or massing of the primary house. The proposed outbuilding is compatible with typical simple outbuilding form and detailing by combining a rectangular design with a side gable asphalt

architectural shingle roof and minimal detailing. The siding is proposed to be yellow pine wood lap siding, of a size and dimension to match the Landmark building. The proposed design and features are compatible with the Landmark building. The proposed design will include six exterior matte black wall lights that look like lanterns. The lights are 12" high by 7" inches wide. The proposed outbuilding is compatible in materials with the historic materials of the Landmark building with regard to composition, size, shape, pattern, texture, scale, detail, color, and surface finish. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standards 5-7; *Outbuildings and Garages*, Landmark Standards 6 and 7)

- 4) The proposed outbuilding utilizes compatible windows that are wood, paired four-light casement windows, which mimic the four-light casement windows found in one of the rear additions of the Landmark building. The south facade will include three sets of paired, wooden French doors flanked by sidelights. The north elevation will include four pairs of four-light casement windows. The east elevation will have two pairs of wooden, four-light casement windows and two wooden, eight-light doors. The Landmark building has one set of wooden double doors and a wooden single door both facing Cherry Street. The doors and windows selected are compatible in configuration, proportion, material, and detail with the windows and doors of the Landmark building. The relationship of solids to voids in the exterior walls is compatible with other secondary structures and the Landmark building. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standard 6; *Outbuildings and Garages*, Landmark Standard 6)
- 5) The Landmark building is an example of the move toward eclecticism in late Victorian architecture, with clearly stated influences of the Gothic Revival, Italianate and Queen Anne styles. The design of the proposed outbuilding is compatible with, but differentiated from, the Landmark building due to its simpler design and style. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standard 8)
- 6) A brick patio is proposed to be located adjacent to the south facade. The brick will be a red, reclaimed brick, laid in a herringbone pattern. An existing sidewalk made of similar brick leads from the parking area to the front porch. This patio is a new feature that is compatible with the visual, spatial, and associative characteristics of the Landmark's setting and historic context. (*Setting*, Landmark Standard 3; *Site Features and Plantings*, Landmark Standard 8)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-021 at the Rogers House, Local Historic Landmark #40, located at 102 South Cherry Street, Winston-Salem (PIN 6835-15-6438), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall meet with historic resources staff and the City's Urban Forester to select appropriate plantings to screen the First and Marshall Street facades of the outbuilding;
- 2) The applicant shall submit a COA application and receive a COA for installation of said plantings within three (3) months of the issuance of the COA and install such plantings within nine (9) months of completion of the project;
- 3) The applicant shall submit a COA application and receive a COA for screening of the HVAC unit prior to installation; the COA application shall include the design, material, height, and details of the screening; the screening shall be installed within three (3) months of the issuance of the COA;
- 4) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 5) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 6) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Adam Spear, Owner, 118 South Cherry Street, Winston-Salem, NC, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The proposed outbuilding will be located at the rear of the lot in a traditional location for outbuildings on this block and site. It is, therefore, compatible with the visual and spatial character of the Landmark's setting. The proposed outbuilding is sited at the rear corner of the property, adjacent to First and Marshall Streets. It is set back from the primary structure's facade along Cherry Street with its main facade oriented south. The 1917 Sanborn Fire Insurance Company map shows two outbuildings adjacent to Marshall Street on this lot, one in the location of the proposed outbuilding. The new construction will not diminish or compromise the character of the Landmark building at this location and conforms to the historic patterns of building setbacks and spacing. The size and the orientation of the proposed building is not consistent with other historical outbuildings, however, no significant site features will be lost with the construction of this outbuilding. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standards 1-3; *Outbuildings and Garages*, Landmark Standards 8-10; *Setting*, Landmark Standard 3)
- 2) The proposed building is one-story, 28' high at its highest, 65' long x 34' wide. Although the building footprint is large, it is a single story, and it does not overpower the Landmark building. There will be less green space in the rear yard. However, the yard was not noted as having any significant features in the Landmark application and report. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standard 4; *Outbuildings and Garages*, Landmark Standard 11)
- 3) Most homes in the downtown had rear yard outbuildings, which were utilitarian in nature and simple in design and shape. Many did not mimic the style or massing of the primary house. The proposed outbuilding is compatible with typical simple outbuilding form and detailing by combining a rectangular design with a side gable asphalt architectural shingle roof and minimal detailing. The siding is proposed to be yellow pine wood lap siding, of a size and dimension to match the Landmark building. The proposed design and features are compatible with the Landmark building. The proposed design will include six exterior matte black wall lights that look like lanterns. The lights are 12" high by 7" inches wide. The proposed outbuilding is compatible in materials with the historic materials of the Landmark building with regard to composition, size, shape, pattern, texture, scale, detail, color, and surface finish. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standards 5-7; *Outbuildings and Garages*, Landmark Standards 6 and 7)
- 4) The proposed outbuilding utilizes compatible windows that are wood, paired four-light casement windows, which mimic the four-light casement windows found in one of the rear additions of the Landmark building. The south facade will include three sets of paired, wooden French doors flanked by sidelights. The north elevation will include four pairs of four-light casement windows. The east elevation will have two pairs of wooden, four-light casement windows and two wooden, eight-light doors. The Landmark building has one set of wooden double doors and a wooden single door both facing Cherry Street. The doors and windows selected are compatible in configuration, proportion, material, and detail with the windows and doors of the Landmark building. The relationship of solids to voids in the exterior walls is compatible with other secondary structures and the Landmark building. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standard 6; *Outbuildings and Garages*, Landmark Standard 6)
- 5) The Landmark building is an example of the move toward eclecticism in late Victorian architecture, with clearly stated influences of the Gothic Revival, Italianate and Queen Anne styles. The design of the proposed outbuilding is compatible with, but differentiated from, the Landmark building due to its simpler design and style. (*New Construction*, Landmark Standard 8)
- 6) A brick patio is proposed to be located adjacent to the south facade. The brick will be a red, reclaimed brick, laid in a herringbone pattern. An existing sidewalk made of similar brick leads from the parking area to the front porch. This patio is a new feature that is compatible with the visual, spatial, and associative characteristics of the Landmark's setting and historic context. (*Setting*, Landmark Standard 3; *Site Features and Plantings*, Landmark Standard 8)

Second: Ms. Pegram

Vote: For: Kaky Berry; Scott Binkley; Chad Gadberry; Emma Haney; CJ Idol; LeAnn Pegram; Noah Reynolds; Janet Shill

Against: Tina Thacker

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission approves COA2022-021 at the Rogers House, Local Historic Landmark #40, located at 102 South Cherry Street, Winston-Salem, (PIN 6835-15-6438) with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall meet with historic resources staff and the City's Urban Forester to select appropriate plantings to screen the First and Marshall Street facades of the outbuilding;
- 2) The applicant shall submit a COA application and receive a COA for installation of said plantings within three (3) months of the issuance of the COA and install such plantings within nine (9) months of completion of the project;
- 3) The applicant shall submit a COA application and receive a COA for screening of the HVAC unit prior to installation; the COA application shall include the design, material, height, and details of the screening; the screening shall be installed within three (3) months of the issuance of the COA;
- 4) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 5) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 6) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Gadberry

Vote: For: Kaky Berry; Scott Binkley; Chad Gadberry; Emma Haney; CJ Idol; LeAnn Pegram; Noah Reynolds; Janet Shill

Against: Tina Thacker

B. Twin City Motor Company Building LLC, Simon Burgess, Applicant
633 North Liberty Street, Winston-Salem
Twin City Motor Company Building
Local Historic Landmark #142
Request: After-the-fact signage installation
COA2022-029

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace two panels in two existing, backlit metal sign cabinets. The panels will be 48" x 72.75" acrylic signs backlit by the cabinets. The signs that existed prior to landmark designation were not compatible with the landmark building in terms of style, time period, materials, and design. It is not appropriate to introduce new panels that are made of contemporary materials that are incompatible with the character of the landmark. (*Signage*, Landmark Standard 5)
- 2) The proposed signs will be internally backlit. Contemporary internally illuminated signage is not compatible with the landmark building. (*Signage*, Landmark Standards 8)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2022-029 at the Twin City Motor Company Building, Local Historic Landmark #142, located at 633 North Liberty Street, Winston-Salem (PIN 6835-28-2505).

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Vic Salem, General Contractor and Project Manager, 1968 Runnymede Road, Winston-Salem, NC, was affirmed for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Ms. Haney moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission find that the proposed project is incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace two panels in two existing, backlit metal sign cabinets. The panels will be 48" x 72.75" acrylic signs backlit by the cabinets. The signs that existed prior to landmark designation were not compatible with the landmark building in terms of style, time period, materials, and design. It is not appropriate to introduce new panels that are made of contemporary materials that are incompatible with the character of the landmark. (*Signage*, Landmark Standard 5)
- 2) The proposed signs will be internally backlit. Contemporary internally illuminated signage is not compatible with the landmark building. (*Signage*, Landmark Standards 8)

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Idol moved that based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission deny COA2022-029 at the Twin City Motor Company Building, Local Historic Landmark #142, located at 633 North Liberty Street (PIN 6835-28-2505).

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

C. Mark G. Vega, Applicant
930 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem
Ligon Electric Warehouse
West End Historic Overlay District #156
Request: Installation of signage
COA2022-030

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to install a 210" x 36" aluminum pan sign above the window to the right of the entry door. A logo and plastic letters that project from the sign face 1" will be mounted on the pan. The sign is not compatible with the size and scale of the building. The design of the sign is not compatible with the Colonial Revival detailing of the building's entrance or design and mounting of the State Farm signage above the left-side window. The aluminum pan, which functions as both a background and the mounting apparatus, is not compatible with the building in appearance, and it does not enhance the sign's design. The sign design contrasts sharply with signage already on the building and, therefore, is not integral to the overall building façade. (*Signage*, West End Standards 1, 6, and 11)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2022-030 at the Ligon Electric Warehouse, located at 930 West Fourth Street (PIN 6825-86-4239), within the West End Historic Overlay District.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Ronald Scott Allen, 138 Grove Lane, Advance, NC, Sign Company Representative, appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application. Ashley Kearns, 103 West Stone Drive, Greensboro, NC, Office Manager for the tenant, appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Continuance

Mr. Idol moved that the Commission continue COA2022-030 until the June 1, 2022 meeting. Additional or changed application material is due by the May 11, 2022 deadline.

Second: Mr. Reynolds

Vote: Unanimous

III. MINOR WORK REPORT

No comments or questions on the Minor Work Report.

IV. OTHER NOMINATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

A. Local Historic Landmark Designation Application

1. Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House
525 North Hawthorne Road, Winston-Salem

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Statement of Significance

The Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House possesses local architectural significance due to its refined Georgian Revival-style design rendered by Charles Barton Keen's Philadelphia-based firm. The remarkably intact residence erected by McNeill Construction Company occupies a sizable prominent corner lot in the Buena Vista subdivision. Although abodes influenced by those on American and European country estates are plentiful in Winston-Salem, with Tudor, Georgian, and Classical Revival styles being the most typical throughout the city's early- to mid-twentieth-century subdivisions, the Hanes House is distinguished by its scale, sophisticated execution, and estate-like setting. The spacious dwelling encompasses a two-and-one-half-story, gable-roofed, ten-bay-wide main block; one-story, hip-roofed, three-bay north service wing; and inset northeast and south two-story porches. The exterior is characterized by white weatherboarded walls, a Ludowici-Celadon tile roof, and classical details. The slightly projecting pedimented central entrance bay, full-height paneled pilasters, carved consoles supporting the flat hood above the entrance, molded cornices, pedimented dormers, and multi-pane double-hung wood windows and French doors are hallmarks of the late Georgian style as executed in the United States during the late eighteenth century. The formal spaces—reception hall, dining room, living room, and library—feature classical cornices, door and window surrounds, and mantels. Single- and double-leaf raised-panel wood doors and wood-framed multi-pane French doors and transoms possess original hardware. Intact finishes include smooth plaster walls and ceilings, tongue-and-groove oak floors, and molded baseboards and chair rails. The nearly freestanding, half-round, curving staircase is characterized by twisted and straight cast-iron balusters capped by molded wood handrails that terminate in a spiral at the bottom. The period of significance is 1923, the dwelling's construction date.

The garage/apartment northwest of the house is original, built in 1923. It is a one-and-one-half-story, weatherboarded, three-bay garage with a second-floor apartment. Pedimented dormers pierce the side-gable green Ludowici-Celadon tile roof above a molded cornice with gable-end returns. Double-hung six-over-six wood-sash windows illuminate the apartment, which is accessed via a single-leaf six-panel wood door at the building's southeast corner. The wood-frame glazed storm door has a lattice-pattern base. The winding wood staircase empties into a short corridor adjacent to the bathroom and north and south bedrooms. The apartment retains plaster walls and ceilings, hardwood floors, baseboards with molded upper edges, simple window and door trim with mitered corners, and four-horizontal-panel doors with original brass hardware and faceted-glass knobs. One multi-pane wood casement window on each of the north, east, and south elevations lights the single garage room, which is secured by replacement roll-up metal doors with exterior faces that emulate weatherboards and a horizontal nine-pane window. The garage has a plaster ceiling and walls and a concrete floor.

The 1923 stone walls are original to the site. The lot's rolling topography necessitated the lengthy rough-face granite retaining walls that border the granite-edged concrete municipal sidewalk as well as the crescent-shaped asphalt-paved driveway. Square granite posts flank the driveway entrances. As the front lawn is at a higher grade than the house, slate-capped granite steps rise from the driveway to the lawn. The retaining walls were constructed in conjunction with the house.

(Heather Fearnbach, Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House Local Historic Landmark Application 1/18/2022)

The current owners are seeking complete Local Historic Landmark designation for the entire Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House exterior and interior and the stone walls and garage/apartment building and site in order to recognize the property's architectural significance. A list of the character-defining features is found in the application on pages 30-32.

Integrity

The property is a significant example of Forsyth County's architecture that possesses integrity of location, setting, design, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association.

Location, Setting, Feeling and Association

The Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House retains high integrity of location, setting, feeling, and association, as it remains on its historic site. The 5.23-acre property provides appropriate estate-like surrounding in keeping with the dwelling's Georgian Revival-style character, thus allowing for integrity of setting, feeling, and association.

Design, Material, and Workmanship

The Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House retains excellent integrity in terms of design, material, and workmanship. The 1923 exterior, characterized by white weatherboarded walls, a green Ludowici-Celadon tile roof, and classical details such as the slightly projecting pedimented central entrance bay, full-height paneled pilasters, carved consoles supporting the flat hood above the entrance, molded cornices, pedimented dormers, and multi-pane double-hung wood windows and French doors remain. Modifications including the south sunporch's glazed enclosure, the enclosure of the west two-thirds of the second-story south porch to create dressing rooms, and the enclosure of the northeast porch to serve as a first-floor breakfast room and second-floor dressing room were executed in a sympathetic manner that preserves original full-height porch columns and paneled pilasters with fluted capitals as well as ornamental black wrought-iron railings with central medallions.

Most rooms in the 1923 residence maintain original volumes and finishes. The formal spaces-reception hall, dining room, living room, and library-feature classical cornices, door and window surrounds, and mantels. Single-and double-leaf raised-panel wood doors and wood-framed multi-pane French doors and transoms possess original hardware. Intact finishes include smooth plaster walls and ceilings, tongue-and-groove oak floors, and molded baseboards and chair rails. The nearly freestanding, half-round, curving staircase is characterized by twisting and straight cast-iron balusters capped by molded wood handrails that terminate in a spiral at the bottom. Service wing expansion and remodeling in 1984 and dressing room and master bathroom suite creation in 2007 were designed to minimize impact on historic fabric. (Heather Fearnbach, Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House Local Historic Landmark Application 1/18/2022)

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends Local Historic Landmark designation of the entire exterior and entire interior and the stone walls and garage/apartment building of the Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House; along with the entire tax block and lot upon which it sits. (Tax Block 1150, Lots 101C and 201 PINs 6825-59-7635, 6825-59-6410).

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Melanie Broyhill, 525 North Hawthorne Road, Winston-Salem, NC, Owner, appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Recommendation

Ms. Pegram move that the Commission find that the Alexander S. and Mary R. Hanes House, 525 North Hawthorne Road, is of special significance in terms of its architectural importance and possesses integrity of design, setting, workmanship, materials, feeling, and association; and recommend to the Winston-Salem City Council that the complete exterior and interior of the house, stone walls, garage/apartment and all of Tax Block 1150, Lots 101C and 201 (PINs 6825-59-7635 and 6825-59-6410) that is highlighted on the map and the qualifying elements exist, as set forth in the Local Historic Landmark Designation Application and report, on file with the Forsyth County Winston-Salem Historic Resources Commission, which is incorporated herein by reference be designated a Local Historic Landmark.

Second: Mr. Reynolds
Vote: Unanimous

V. COMMITTEE REPORTS

A. Historic Marker Committee

1. Winston-Salem Rescue Squad Unveiling

Ms. Bratland thanked the Commission members who attended the April 23, 2022 Winston-Salem Rescue Squad Marker Unveiling. The event was a great success with over 100 people in attendance.

2. St. Philip's Moravian Church – Origin 1822 Unveiling

Ms. Bratland thanked the Commission members who attended the April 30, 2022 St. Philips Moravian Church – Origin 1822 Marker Unveiling. The event was a great success with over 100 people in attendance.

B. Education Committee

1. Preservation Month

Ms. McCullough discussed the social media program that will focus on architectural styles that are found in Forsyth County.

VI. STAFF REPORT

A. Commission retreat scheduled for July 27, 12:00-5:00 p.m.

Ms. McCullough reminded the Commission of the retreat in July.

B. CLG grant applications submitted

Ms. Bratland updated the Commission that two CLG grant applications were submitted for 2022-2023, one for the Old Salem Historic District Standards Update, and one for the Cemetery Mapping project.

C. Commission meeting location

Ms. Bratland told the Commission that the June 1, 2022 meeting will be held back in the Bryce A. Stuart Building.

VII. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER