



Minutes
Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission
August 2, 2023
4:00 p.m.
Bryce A. Stuart Municipal Building
Arnold G. King Public Meeting Room, 5th Floor
100 East First Street, Winston-Salem

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chair; C.J. Idol, Vice-Chair; Scott Binkley; Edwin Bouldin; Chad Gadberry; Chenita Johnson; Veronica Kromm; Nicole Townsend-Green

MEMBERS ABSENT: Noah Reynolds

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland; Michelle McCullough; Deputy City Attorney Jerry Kontos

Chair Berry called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. Chair Berry introduce new Commission member Chenita Johnson.

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of June 7, 2023 Meeting Minutes

MOTION by Mr. Bouldin to approve the June 7, 2023, minutes.

SECOND: Mr. Binkley

Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

A. Bradley Cokendolpher, Applicant
515 Jersey Avenue, Winston-Salem
Martin House
West End Historic Overlay District #240
Contributing
Request: After-the-fact installation of a rear-yard fence
COA2023-059

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The fence is located in an area of low visibility. One 70' section will run along the rear property line. A 17' section with a 4' gate will connect the rear corner of the house to the southern property line. A 26' section with an 8' double gate will connect the rear corner of the house to the northern property line. The fence will be constructed from dog-eared wooden boards and will be 6' high. The fence will minimize its impact on the special character of the West End and property. Wood is an appropriate fence material in areas of low visibility, and soldi fences are appropriate in rear yards when not adjacent to the street. The fence will be constructed with its structural side facing in toward the rear yard. (*Fences*, West End Standards 2, 4-6)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding finding, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2023-059 at 515 Jersey Avenue (PIN 6825-77-9312) within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The commercial sign shall be removed from the fence within ninety (90) days; and

- 2) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: None.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Motion

Mr. Bouldin moved that the following Order be entered in COA2023-059:

On August 2, 2023, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission (“Commission”) conducted, in the above referenced matter, a public hearing in accordance with the statutes and case law pertaining to quasi-judicial proceedings for the issuance of certificates of appropriateness. During the hearing, Heather Bratland, Historic Resources Officer, presented the staff report, findings, and recommendation. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in opposition to the application.

After presentation of all testimony and evidence, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, finds that the proposed work is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The fence is located in an area of low visibility. One 70’ section will run along the rear property line. A 17’ section with a 4’ gate will connect the rear corner of the house to the southern property line. A 26’ section with an 8’ double gate will connect the rear corner of the house to the northern property line. The fence will be constructed from dog-eared wooden boards and will be 6’ high. The fence will minimize its impact on the special character of the West End and property. Wood is an appropriate fence material in areas of low visibility, and solid fences are appropriate in rear yards when not adjacent to the street. The fence will be constructed with its structural side facing in toward the rear yard. (*Fences*, West End Standards 2, 4-6)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2023-059 at 515 Jersey Avenue (PIN 6825-77-9312) within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The commercial sign shall be removed from the fence within ninety (90) days;
- 2) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

SECOND: Ms. Kromm
Vote: Unanimous

B. Sage and Salt, Applicant
300 South Liberty Street, Winston-Salem
Winston-Salem Southbound Railway Freight Warehouse & Office
Local Historic Landmark #82
Request: Installation of signage
COA2023-061

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the application is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The proposed project introduces one hanging sign at the entrance and one wall mounted sign on the east elevation. The hanging sign is a 32" x 62" oval, made of routed PVC. It will be hung on existing hooks in the ceiling of the canopy. The wall mounted sign is a 48" x 90" oval and made of Maxmetal aluminum with 3M digital print. The signs are compatible with the Landmark building and site in terms of style, time period, design, scale, and color. (*Signage*, Landmark Standards 4 and 5)
- 2) The proposed project introduces new signage in locations that do not diminish or compromise the historic character of the Landmark building or site. The signs will replace existing signage. The hanging sign is located over the main entrance on the south elevation and the wall mounted sign is located on the north elevation. The signs do not conceal significant architectural features or details. The new signs do not shadow or overpower adjacent structures. (*Signage*, Landmark Standard 6)
- 3) The proposed project introduces new signage that is removable. (*Signage*, Landmark Standard 7)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2023-061 at the Winston-Salem Southbound Railway Freight Warehouse & Office, Local Historic Landmark #82, 300 South Liberty Street (PIN: 6835-24-4704.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The sign shall be removed if the space remains completely unoccupied for a period longer than 180 days. When the sign is removed, the surface to which it was attached shall be repaired or restored to eliminate any evidence of the removed sign;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: None.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Motion

Mr. Idol moved that the following Order be entered in COA2023-061:

On August 2, 2023, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission ("Commission") conducted, in the above referenced matter, a public hearing in accordance with the statutes and case law pertaining to quasi-judicial proceedings for the issuance of certificates of appropriateness. During the hearing, Michelle McCullough, Historic Resources Officer, presented the staff report, findings, and recommendation. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in opposition to the application.

After presentation of all testimony and evidence, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, finds that the proposed work is not incongruous with the character of the Local Historic Landmark because the proposed work:

- 1) The proposed project introduces one hanging sign at the entrance and one wall mounted sign on the east elevation. The hanging sign is a 32" x 62" oval, made of routed PVC. It will be hung on existing hooks in the ceiling of the canopy. The wall mounted sign is a 48" x 90" oval and made of Maxmetal aluminum with 3M digital print. The signs are compatible with the Landmark building and site in terms of style, time period, design, scale, and color. (*Signage*, Landmark Standards 4 and 5)

2) The proposed project introduces new signage in locations that do not diminish or compromise the historic character of the Landmark building or site. The signs will replace existing signage. The hanging sign is located over the main entrance on the south elevation and the wall mounted sign is located on the north elevation. The signs do not conceal significant architectural features or details. The new signs do not shadow or overpower adjacent structures. (*Signage*, Landmark Standard 6)

3) The proposed project introduces new signage that is removable. (*Signage*, Landmark Standard 7)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2023-061 at the Winston-Salem Southbound Railway Freight Warehouse & Office, Local Historic Landmark #82, 300 South Liberty Street (PIN: 6835-24-4704.00), with the following condition:

- 1) The sign shall be removed if the space remains completely unoccupied for a period longer than 180 days. When the sign is removed, the surface to which it was attached shall be repaired or restored to eliminate any evidence of the removed sign;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

SECOND: Ms. Johnson
Vote: Unanimous

C. West End Renaissance Residence Development LLC, Trent Adams, Applicant
255 Glade View Court, Winston-Salem
House
West End Historic Overlay District #611
Noncontributing
Request: New construction of a single-family house
COA2023-067

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the application is not incongruous with the character of the District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to construct a single-family house on a lot on the east side of Glade View Court. The lot drops approximately 20' from east to west. The setback, spacing, and orientation of the house on the lot are compatible with those of nearby buildings that contribute to the character of the West End. The site has already been partially graded and disturbance will be minimal. The site character, topography, and vistas and views will not be substantially altered. The site does not have any character-defining site features. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 1-3)
- 2) The 1 ½ story on basement height, rectilinear form, side gable roof, and 5-bay width of the house are compatible in height, form, size, scale, massing, proportion, and roof shape with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. The doors and windows are arranged asymmetrically with paired four-over-four windows, three single four-over-four windows, and a single-leaf door with sidelights behind a three-bay porch at the first floor; and an end-gable dormer with three four-over-four windows on the second floor. The secondary facades use an asymmetrical arrangement of banked and single four-over-four windows mixed with paired six-light casement windows and single-leaf doors, which is typical for secondary facades. The spacing, placement, scale, orientation, proportion, and size of the window and door openings is compatible with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 4-5)

- 3) The proposed windows are aluminum clad wood windows with simulated divided light muntins that use permanently applied interior and exterior grilles. These window details are the same as those required for replacement windows on contributing structures in the West End. The proposed doors are constructed from wood in several traditional configurations with true-divided-light windows, which are found commonly in the West End. The material, proportion, pattern, and details of the windows and doors are compatible with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. (*New Construction*, West End Standard 6)
- 4) The proposed house will be clad with Pinehall Brick's Old Yorktown brick series at the basement, painted, smooth finished Hardie Artisan smooth siding in a board-and-batten configuration on the main body of the house and shakes in the gable ends, and Certainteed Landmark Pro series asphalt shingles in Moire Black. Painted Hardie fiber cement products will also be used for soffit and trim details. Porch railings with square balusters will be constructed from Perennial Wood, a treated Southern pine, and painted. Tapered porch posts are a resin and marble dust composite and will be painted. Porch decking will be square-edge Trex. Garage doors will be steel with factory-finished paint. The light fixtures are a lantern style with seeded glass. The materials and finishes are compatible with, yet discernable from, historic materials and finishes found in surrounding historic buildings in terms of composition, scale, module, pattern, detail, texture, and finish. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 7-8)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2023-067 at 255 Glade View Court (PIN 6825-76-4479), located in the West End Historic Overlay District with the following conditions:

- 1) Within six (6) months of the issuance of this Certificate of Appropriateness, the applicant shall install granite curbing to match adjacent historic granite curbing in three (3) locations in the Glade Street right-of-way where entrances and exits to the YWCA property were previously located, remove the concrete apron, and restore the planting strip;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor: Trent Adams, 307 Mill Street, Winston-Salem, NC, contractor.

Speaking: James Conrad, 269 Glade View Court, Winston-Salem, NC, neighbor.

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Motion

Mr. Gadberry moved that the following Order be entered in COA2023-067:

On August 2, 2023, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission ("Commission") conducted, in the above referenced matter, a public hearing in accordance with the statutes and case law pertaining to quasi-judicial proceedings for the issuance of certificates of appropriateness. During the hearing, Heather Bratland, Historic Resources Officer, presented the staff report, findings, and recommendation. Trent Adams, applicant, appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application. James Conrad appeared to present testimony and evidence regarding the application. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in opposition to the application.

After presentation of all testimony and evidence, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, finds that the proposed work is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because the proposed work:

- 1) The applicant proposes to construct a single-family house on a lot on the east side of Glade View Court. The lot drops approximately 20' from east to west. The setback, spacing, and orientation of the house on the lot are compatible with those of nearby buildings that contribute to the character of the West End. The site has already been partially graded and disturbance will be minimal. The site character, topography, and vistas and views will not be substantially altered. The site does not have any character-defining site features. (*New Construction, West End Standards 1-3*)
- 2) The 1 ½ story on basement height, rectilinear form, side gable roof, and 5-bay width of the house are compatible in height, form, size, scale, massing, proportion, and roof shape with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. The doors and windows are arranged asymmetrically with paired four-over-four windows, three single four-over-four windows, and a single-leaf door with sidelights behind a three-bay porch at the first floor; and an end-gable dormer with three four-over-four windows on the second floor. The secondary facades use an asymmetrical arrangement of banked and single four-over-four windows mixed with paired six-light casement windows and single-leaf doors, which is typical for secondary facades. The spacing, placement, scale, orientation, proportion, and size of the window and door openings is compatible with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. (*New Construction, West End Standards 4-5*)
- 3) The proposed windows are aluminum clad wood windows with simulated divided light muntins that use permanently applied interior and exterior grilles. These window details are the same as those required for replacement windows on contributing structures in the West End. The proposed doors are constructed from wood in several traditional configurations with true-divided-light windows, which are found commonly in the West End. The material, proportion, pattern, and details of the windows and doors are compatible with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. (*New Construction, West End Standard 6*)
- 4) The proposed house will be clad with Pinehall Brick's Old Yorktown brick series at the basement, painted, smooth finished Hardie Artisan smooth siding in a board-and-batten configuration on the main body of the house and shakes in the gable ends, and Certainteed Landmark Pro series asphalt shingles in Moire Black. Painted Hardie fiber cement products will also be used for soffit and trim details. Porch railings with square balusters will be constructed from Perennial Wood, a treated Southern pine, and painted. Tapered porch posts are a resin and marble dust composite and will be painted. Porch decking will be square-edge Trex. Garage doors will be steel with factory-finished paint. The light fixtures are a lantern style with seeded glass. The materials and finishes are compatible with, yet discernable from, historic materials and finishes found in surrounding historic buildings in terms of composition, scale, module, pattern, detail, texture, and finish. (*New Construction, West End Standards 7-8*)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2023-067 at 255 Glade View Court (PIN 6825-76-4479), located in the West End Historic Overlay District with the following conditions:

- 1) Within six (6) months of the issuance of this Certificate of Appropriateness, the applicant shall install granite curbing to match adjacent historic granite curbing in three (3) locations in the Glade Street right-of-way where entrances and exits to the YWCA property were previously located, remove the concrete apron, and restore the planting strip;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

SECOND: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

D. Adam Spear, Applicant
102 South Cherry Street, Winston-Salem
Rogers House
Local Historic Landmark #40
Request: Installation of artificial grass
COA2023-068

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the application is incongruous with the character of the Landmark because:

- 1) The proposed project introduces a 41' x 46' square of Pro Syn-Turf, PST-Newport variety. The artificial turf, a substitute material for grass, is for high traffic areas and is installed with a 3"-4" system that includes weed barrier, decomposed granite or class II road base, drain rock, and wire mesh on top of the existing soil/ground. The artificial turf is proposed to be located in the southwest corner of the property between the existing outbuilding, the rear of the historic house, and the proposed new outbuilding that has not been built yet. Installation of artificial turf is not typically considered a traditional method of maintaining a historic lawn. It does not retain and preserve the grassed rear lawn. Staff has concerns about the transition from real grass to the artificial turf on the south, east, and portions of the west sides of the proposed artificial turf square. Further, staff has no data on the long-term performance of the artificial turf with respect to color fastness, durability, ability to repair, or the timeline for replacement. (*Site Features and Plantings*, Landmark Standards 1 and 3)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2023-068 at the Rogers House, Local Historic Landmark #40, 102 South Cherry Street (PIN 6835-15-6438.00).

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Austin Hayes, 562 West 2nd Street, Winston-Salem, NC, project partner.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Motion

Mr. Gadberry moved that the following Order be entered in COA2023-052:

On August 2, 2023, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission ("Commission") conducted, in the above referenced matter, a public hearing in accordance with the statutes and case law pertaining to quasi-judicial proceedings for the issuance of certificates of appropriateness. During the hearing, Michelle McCullough, Historic Resources Officer, presented the staff report, findings, and recommendation. Austin Hayes, applicant, appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in opposition to the application.

After presentation of all testimony and evidence, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, finds that the proposed work is incongruous with the character of the Local Historic Landmark because:

- 1) The proposed project introduces a 41' x 46' square of Pro Syn-Turf, PST-Newport variety. The artificial turf, a substitute material for grass, is for high traffic areas and is installed with a 3"-4" system that includes weed barrier, decomposed granite or class II road base, drain rock, and wire mesh on top of the existing soil/ground. The artificial turf is proposed to be located in the southwest corner of the property between the existing outbuilding, the rear of the historic house, and the proposed new outbuilding that has not been built yet. Installation of artificial turf is not typically considered a traditional method of maintaining a historic lawn. It does not retain and preserve the grassed rear lawn. Staff has concerns about the transition from real grass to the artificial turf on the south, east, and portions of the west sides of the proposed artificial turf square. Further, staff has no data on the long-term performance of the artificial turf with respect to color fastness, durability, ability to repair, or the timeline for replacement. (*Site Features and Plantings*, Landmark Standards 1 and 3)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby denies COA2023-068 at the Rogers House, Local Historic Landmark #40, 102 South Cherry Street (PIN 6835-15-6438.00).

SECOND:

Mr. Bouldin

Vote:

For: Ms. Berry; Mr. Binkely; Mr. Bouldin; Mr. Gadberry; Mr. Idol; Ms. Johnson; Ms. Kromm

Against: Ms. Townsend-Green

- E. Ariana Hood, Applicant
602 South Church Street, Building 25, Winston-Salem
Rondthaler-Gramley House
Old Salem Historic District
Noncontributing
Request: Installation of ADA ramp and railing
COA2023-074

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the application is not incongruous with the character of the District because:

- 1) The proposed project introduces a new self-supported ADA ramp and railing that leads from a brick sidewalk on the west side of the building. The ramp will be 6' wide by 27' in length. The ramp will be made from concrete and the sides will be faced with brick. The brick will match the existing brick of the sidewalk in design, style, dimension, detail, hardness, texture, pattern, material, and color as closely as possible. The ramp meets accessibility building code in such a way that the site and its character-defining features and the structure's character-defining elevation, features, and finishes are preserved. The design of the new landing and ramp are compatible with the scale, materials, details, and finish of the structure and existing rear porch. The house is located behind the buildings on Church Street and is not visible from any street within the District. Therefore, the ramp is located in an unobtrusive location and does not detract from the historic character of the District. The proposed ramp installation is reversible. The wooden steps that lead onto the porch will be removed to install the ramp. There is no other compromise of the original design of the entrance or porch. (*Safety, Accessibility and Code Requirements*, District Standards 1-4, and 6)
- 2) The proposed project will install metal railing along the new ramp and landing as required by current accessibility code, compliant with ANSI A117.1. The new railing will be a simple design that will be compatible in pattern, spacing, configuration, dimension, scale, materials, and color with the character of the structure and District. (*Railings*, District Standard 4 and *Safety, Accessibility and Code Requirements*, District Standards 1 and 6)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2023-074 at Rondthaler-Gramley House, 601 South Church Street, Building 25 (PIN: 6835-32-8748.00), located in the Old Salem Historic District with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Ariana Hood, CPL, 400 Bellemeade Street, Suite 401, Greensboro, NC, architect.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Motion

Ms. Kromm moved that the following Order be entered in COA2023-074:

On August 2, 2023, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission (“Commission”) conducted, in the above referenced matter, a public hearing in accordance with the statutes and case law pertaining to quasi-judicial proceedings for the issuance of certificates of appropriateness. During the hearing, Michelle McCullough, Historic Resources Officer, presented the staff report, findings, and recommendation. Ariana Hood, applicant, appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in opposition to the application.

After presentation of all testimony and evidence, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, finds that the proposed work is not incongruous with the character of the Old Salem Historic District because:

- 1) The proposed project introduces a new self-supported ADA ramp and railing that leads from a brick sidewalk on the west side of the building. The ramp will be 6’ wide by 27’ in length. The ramp will be made from concrete and the sides will be faced with brick. The brick will match the existing brick of the sidewalk in design, style, dimension, detail, hardness, texture, pattern, material, and color as closely as possible. The ramp meets accessibility building code in such a way that the site and its character-defining features and the structure’s character-defining elevation, features, and finishes are preserved. The design of the new landing and ramp are compatible with the scale, materials, details, and finish of the structure and existing rear porch. The house is located behind the buildings on Church Street and is not visible from any street within the District. Therefore, the ramp is located in an unobtrusive location and does not detract from the historic character of the District. The proposed ramp installation is reversible. The wooden steps that lead onto the porch will be removed to install the ramp. There is no other compromise of the original design of the entrance or porch. (*Safety, Accessibility and Code Requirements*, District Standards 1-4, and 6)
- 2) The proposed project will install metal railing along the new ramp and landing as required by current accessibility code, compliant with ANSI A117.1. The new railing will be a simple design that will be compatible in pattern, spacing, configuration, dimension, scale, materials, and color with the character of the structure and District. (*Railings*, District Standard 4 and *Safety, Accessibility and Code Requirements*, District Standards 1 and 6)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2023-074 at Rondthaler-Gramley House, 601 South Church Street, Building 25 (PIN: 6835-32-8748.00), located in the Old Salem Historic District with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

SECOND: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

- F. Summit Street Properties LLC, Lou Baldwin, Applicant
420 Summit Street, Winston-Salem
B.J. Sheppard House
434 Summit Street, Winston-Salem
Jacob Lott Ludlow House
West End Historic Overlay District #106 and 107
Contributing
Request: Installation of signage
COA2023-075

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to install seven (7) identification and traffic signs on the campus. Six (6) of the signs will be 12" x 15"; one (1) will be 48" x 27" mounted between two 15" high posts. All posts will be aluminum. The signs will be constructed from aluminum and display Summit Street Inns logo and name, a band of color that references the stained-glass windows of the Ludlow House, wording, and arrows. The signs will be compatible with the size, scale, and design of the buildings and site. The signs will not conceal, obscure, damage, or destroy any significant architectural features or details, and they will not significantly block streetscape views. The signs will not shadow or overpower adjacent structures, and they will be removable. The signs will be freestanding, as required when installed for nonresidential use at a residential building. Four (4) of the signs will be located in areas of low visibility, toward the center of the campus in parking lots. Three (3) of the signs will be located adjacent to driveways and the public sidewalk to provide identification of the business directions into the parking lots. (*Signage, West End Standards 1-5 and 10*)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2023-075 at 420 and 434 Summit Street (PINs 6825-86-5828 and 6825-86-5939) within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies.
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor: None.

Speaking in Opposition: None

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Motion

Mr. Bouldin moved that the following Order be entered in COA2023-075:

On August 2, 2023, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission ("Commission") conducted, in the above referenced matter, a public hearing in accordance with the statutes and case law pertaining to quasi-judicial proceedings for the issuance of certificates of appropriateness. During the hearing, Heather Bratland, Historic Resources Officer, presented the staff report, findings, and recommendation. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in opposition to the application.

After presentation of all testimony and evidence, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, finds that the proposed work is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because the proposed work:

- 1) The applicant proposes to install seven (7) identification and traffic signs on the campus. Six (6) of the signs will be 12" x 15"; one (1) will be 48" x 27" mounted between two 15" high posts. All posts will be aluminum. The signs will be constructed from aluminum and display Summit Street Inns logo and name, a band of color that references the stained-glass windows of the Ludlow House, wording, and arrows. The signs will be compatible with the size, scale, and design of the buildings and site. The signs will not conceal, obscure, damage, or destroy any significant architectural features or details, and they will not significantly block streetscape views. The signs will not shadow or overpower adjacent structures, and they will be removable. The signs will be freestanding, as required when installed for nonresidential use at a residential building. Four (4) of the signs will be located in areas of low visibility, toward the center of the campus in parking lots. Three (3) of the signs will be located adjacent to driveways and the public sidewalk to provide identification of the business directions into the parking lots. (*Signage, West End Standards 1-5 and 10*)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2023-075 at 420 and 434 Summit Street (PINs 6825-86-5828 and 6825-86-5939) within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies.
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

SECOND: Ms. Johnson
Vote: Unanimous

G. RSM 1121 WESTEND LLC, Vasilis Michael, Applicant
1121 West End Boulevard, Winston-Salem
Apartments
West End Historic Overlay District #544
Noncontributing
Request: After-the-fact exterior alterations
COA2023-077

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The Apartments were constructed after 1930, specifically ca. 1960. They do not appear on the 1958 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map, and the first classified advertisement offering the units for lease is found in the September 25, 1960, edition of the Winston-Salem Journal. They were built by local restaurateur Chip Berrier and his wife Fannie and have no individual historical or architectural significance. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standards)
- 2) Painting the modern brick veneer exterior; replacing the unit entry doors with wooden, paneled Craftsman style doors with lights in the upper third; replacing the exterior metal stair with a new metal stair that is substantially the same in design, material, location, and dimensions; removing the non-original lattice panels that were mounted on the street façade of the building; replacing exterior light fixtures; replacing the through-wall air conditioning units with brick infill; and installing shutters at all windows are alterations that are compatible with the style and character of the Apartments and make it more compatible with the special character of the West End and surrounding buildings. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 3)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2023-077 at 1121 West End Boulevard (PIN 6825-74-3299) within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies.
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor: None.

Speaking in Opposition: None

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Motion

Mr. Idol moved that the following Order be entered in COA2023-077:

On August 2, 2023, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission (“Commission”) conducted, in the above referenced matter, a public hearing in accordance with the statutes and case law pertaining to quasi-judicial proceedings for the issuance of certificates of appropriateness. During the hearing, Heather Bratland, Historic Resources Officer, presented the staff report, findings, and recommendation. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in opposition to the application.

After presentation of all testimony and evidence, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, finds that the proposed work is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because the proposed work:

- 1) The Apartments were constructed after 1930, specifically ca. 1960. They do not appear on the 1958 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map, and the first classified advertisement offering the units for lease is found in the September 25, 1960, edition of the Winston-Salem Journal. They were built by local restaurateur Chip Berrier and his wife Fannie and have no individual historical or architectural significance. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standards)
- 2) Painting the modern brick veneer exterior; replacing the unit entry doors with wooden, paneled Craftsman style doors with lights in the upper third; replacing the exterior metal stair with a new metal stair that is substantially the same in design, material, location, and dimensions; removing the non-original lattice panels that were mounted on the street façade of the building; replacing exterior light fixtures; replacing the through-wall air conditioning units with brick infill; and installing shutters at all windows are alterations that are compatible with the style and character of the Apartments and make it more compatible with the special character of the West End and surrounding buildings. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 3)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2023-077 at 1121 West End Boulevard (PIN 6825-74-3299) within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies.
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

SECOND: Mr. Gadberry
Vote: Unanimous

III. **MINOR WORK REPORT**

No comments.

IV. **OTHER NOMINATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS**

Chair Berry called for a recess from 5:42 p.m. until 5:50 p.m.

V. COMMITTEE REPORTS

A. Historic Marker Committee

Ms. Bratland reminded the Commission of the upcoming application deadline of October 31.

1. New member needed

1. Next meeting is November 15 at 5:00 p.m.

B. Education Committee

Ms. McCullough updated the plans for the 75th celebration on November 4.

1. 75th Anniversary update

2. Next meeting is August 28 at 3:30 p.m.

C. Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Committee

1. New member needed

2. Juneteenth event report

Ms. Townsend-Green discussed the Juneteenth event and the mapping/oral history project.

3. [Green Book](#) story map update

Ms. Bratland showed a sample entry from the Green Book Story Map and discussed the project.

4. [We Built This](#) exhibit update

Ms. Bratland confirmed that the exhibit will be hosted by the City of Winston-Salem in February 2024 and be on display at Union Station and the Fairgrounds. In March 2024 it will move to the O'Kelly Library at Winston-Salem State University. The translation is underway.

5. Next meeting TBD

VI. STAFF REPORT

A. Annual Commission Retreat on September 29th from 10:00 a.m.-3:00 p.m. at Robert Hall, 874 N. Liberty Street, Winston-Salem

Staff reminded the Commission of the retreat and asked members to send topics for discussion in.

B. HRC fees update

Ms. McCullough updated the Commission on the increased fees for after-the-fact COA applications (\$500), landmark designation (\$1,500), and demolition (\$500-2,500).

Ms. Bratland informed the Commission that the Matthews House on West Fifth Street owned by Augsburg Lutheran Church would be demolished in the next few weeks.

Ms. Bratland informed the Commission that the appeal of COA2023-018 from the April meeting would be heard by the Winston-Salem Zoning Board of Adjustment on August 3, 2023.

C. Commission structure update

Ms. Bratland informed the Commission that the Forsyth County Commissioners approved the update to the Commission structure.

D. Old Salem Historic District state highway historic marker update

Ms. Bratland informed the Commission that the marker had been installed

E. FY2022-2023 Environmental Review Annual Report

Ms. Bratland briefly discussed the Section 106 review process and the annual report of environmental reviews.

F. Local Historic Landmark application update

Ms. McCullough discussed the update to the landmark application to provide more scope for designation of properties for historical/cultural reasons as opposed to architectural significance.

G. Unmarked Initiative update

Ms. Bratland informed the Commission that the cemetery mapping project was almost complete. Staff provided location information on a handful of final cemeteries this week.

H. *Old Salem Historic District Guide to the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Process and Design Review Standards* update

Ms. McCullough explained the process for gathering community input on changes to the Design Review Standards and the timeline for the project.

Ms. McCullough informed the Commission that the City will cover the cost for a single lost badge for each member; lost badges after the first will cost \$10 and be billed to the Commission member.

Ms. Bratland informed the Commission that the Heritage Neighborhoods proposal should be heard by the CD/H/GG Committee of the Winston-Salem City Council in October.

VII. **FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER**

NEXT MEETING: September 6, 2023