



**Minutes
Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission
August 3, 2022
4:00 p.m.
Bryce A. Stuart Municipal Building
Arnold G. King Public Meeting Room, 5th Floor
100 East First Street, Winston-Salem**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chair; C.J. Idol, Vice-Chair; Scott Binkley; Edwin Bouldin; Noah Reynolds; Janet Shill; Tina Thacker; Nicole Townsend-Green

MEMBERS ABSENT: Chad Gadberry; Emma Haney; Veronica Kromm; LeAnn Pegram

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland; Michelle McCullough
Deputy City Attorney Jerry Kontos

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of June 1, 2022, Minutes

MOTION by Ms. Thacker to approve the June 1, 2022, minutes.

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

- A. James W. Lester Jr., Applicant
823 South Church Street, Winston-Salem
Anna Johanna Vogler House
Old Salem Historic District
Local Historic Landmark #35
**Request: Removal of an American Holly tree
COA2022-042**

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the Landmark and Old Salem Historic District because:

- 1) On December 2, 2020, the Commission approved COA2020-126. One part of the application requested to repave the current inappropriate asphalt driveway with pea gravel exposed aggregate concrete. The new material, pea gravel, was found to be compatible in size, shape, appearance, color, and texture with the Landmark site and District. The American Holly tree that is being proposed for removal is located adjacent to the driveway and is causing damage to the driveway. The tree is not listed as a Forsyth County Treasure Tree, which is a designation that recognizes the county's largest, rarest, and oldest trees. Also, there is no documentation that this tree was part of the historic landscape, therefore it could be considered a volunteer on the property. As such, its removal will not alter the historic environment in the district. (*Site Features and Plantings*, Landmark Standard 6; and *Significant Landscape Features*, Old Salem Standard 3)
- 2) Due to the property boundaries, the location of the garage, and the location of the garage doors, the driveway cannot be relocated. The approved driveway project, COA2020-126, will make the driveway more congruous with the Landmark and the District. A significant amount of the root mass of the tree will be compromised during the project, and the tree roots cannot be protected because the tree is less than five feet from the driveway. It is impossible to maintain the minimum approach distances for the protection zone and to replace the existing deteriorated driveway. The driveway project will also damage large diameter roots due to excavation which will take place within the structural root plate, potentially causing structural instability or tree mortality issues. (*Significant Landscape Features*, Old Salem Standard 5)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-042 at the Anna Johanna Vogler House, Local Historic Landmark #35, located at 823 South Church Street, Winston-Salem (PIN 6835-32-4072), with the following conditions:

- 1) The tree shall be removed in its entirety and the tree stump shall be ground or removed mechanically to below the existing grade;
- 2) If during the removal any archaeological features are uncovered, the work shall stop immediately, and historic resources staff shall be contacted to assist with a recovery plan;
- 3) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 4) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 5) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: James Lester, 823 South Church Street, Winston-Salem, owner.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of Local Historic Landmark #35 and the Old Salem Historic District because:

- 1) On December 2, 2020, the Commission approved COA2020-126. One part of the application requested to repave the current inappropriate asphalt driveway with pea gravel exposed aggregate concrete. The new material, pea gravel, was found to be compatible in size, shape, appearance, color, and texture with the Landmark site and District. The American Holly tree that is being proposed for removal is located adjacent to the driveway and is causing damage to the driveway. The tree is not listed as a Forsyth County Treasure Tree, which is a designation that recognizes the county's largest, rarest, and oldest trees. Also, there is no documentation that this tree was part of the historic landscape, therefore it could be considered a volunteer on the property. As such, its removal will not alter the historic environment in the district. (*Site Features and Plantings*, Landmark Standard 6; and *Significant Landscape Features*, Old Salem Standard 3)
- 2) Due to the property boundaries, the location of the garage, and the location of the garage doors, the driveway cannot be relocated. The approved driveway project, COA2020-126, will make the driveway more congruous with the Landmark and the District. A significant amount of the root mass of the tree will be compromised during the project, and the tree roots cannot be protected because the tree is less than five feet from the driveway. It is impossible to maintain the minimum approach distances for the protection zone and to replace the existing deteriorated driveway. The driveway project will also damage large diameter roots due to excavation which will take place within the structural root plate, potentially causing structural instability or tree mortality issues. (*Significant Landscape Features*, Old Salem Standard 5)

Second: Ms. Thacker
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Thacker moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2022-042 and grant a certificate of appropriateness for work at the Anna Johanna Vogler House located at 823 South Church Street, Winston-Salem, Local Historic Landmark #35, within the Old Salem Historic District, subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The tree shall be removed in its entirety and the tree stump shall be ground or removed mechanically to below the existing grade;
- 2) If during the removal any archaeological features are uncovered, the work shall stop immediately, and historic resources staff shall be contacted to assist with a recovery plan;
- 3) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 4) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 5) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

B. Rusty Carringer, Crown Castle, Applicant
888 West Fourth Street and 132 North Sunset Drive, Winston-Salem
Right-of-way
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: Replacement of utility poles; installation of wireless antennas
COA2022-049

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the existing utility pole and streetlight at the corner of Brookstown Avenue and West Fourth Street with a new utility pole and streetlight. The new pole design does not match the existing poles along West Fourth Street between Brookstown Avenue and the edge of the West End Historic Overlay District. The proposed pole has a streetlight supported with a single piece arm, while the existing poles have lights supported with three-part arms. The difference in the pole and streetlight design will create visual discontinuity along West Fourth Street, which will detract from the special character of the West End. (*Exterior Lighting*, West End Standard 5)
- 2) Both poles will be capped with concealed poletop antennas. The existing pole on West Fourth Street is 30' 1" high, and the new pole and antenna will be 37' 8" high. The existing pole on North Sunset Drive is 33' high, and the new pole and antenna will be 39' 5" high. Both poles will include a 5' x 2' 4.75" Qwiksite Qube shrouded 4G antenna. On West Fourth Street the bottom of the Qube will be mounted 8' above the sidewalk; on North Sunset Drive the bottom of the Qube will be mounted 11' 6" above the sidewalk. The Qube shrouded antennas will be within the sightline of an average pedestrian and visually obtrusive, e.g., Federal Highway Administration standards for pedestrian signal heads require mounting between 7' and 10' above the sidewalk to maximize visibility. Technological equipment that is incongruous with the special character of the West End shall be located in areas of low visibility, be screened, or be located so that it is visually unobtrusive. (*Accessory Features: Structural and Mechanical Systems*, West End Standards 2-4)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2022-049 at the right-of-way, located at 888 West Fourth Street and 132 North Sunset Drive, within the West End Historic Overlay District.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Rusty Carringer, 1150 Colony Drive, Kings Mountain, NC, Permitting Technician for applicant, and Jordan Peters, 4911 Elementary View Drive, Charlotte, NC, Network Construction Manager for applicant.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Ms. Thacker moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the existing utility pole and streetlight at the corner of Brookstown Avenue and West Fourth Street with a new utility pole and streetlight. The new pole design does not match the existing poles along West Fourth Street between Brookstown Avenue and the edge of the West End Historic Overlay District. The proposed pole has a streetlight supported with a single piece arm, while the existing poles have lights supported with three-part arms. The difference in the pole and streetlight design will create visual discontinuity along West Fourth Street, which will detract from the special character of the West End. (*Exterior Lighting, West End Standard 5*)
- 2) Both poles will be capped with concealed poletop antennas. The existing pole on West Fourth Street is 30' 1" high, and the new pole and antenna will be 37' 8" high. The existing pole on North Sunset Drive is 33' high, and the new pole and antenna will be 39' 5" high. Both poles will include a 5' x 2' 4.75" Qwiksite Qube shrouded 4G antenna. On West Fourth Street the bottom of the Qube will be mounted 8' above the sidewalk; on North Sunset Drive the bottom of the Qube will be mounted 11' 6" above the sidewalk. The Qube shrouded antennas will be within the sightline of an average pedestrian and visually obtrusive, e.g., Federal Highway Administration standards for pedestrian signal heads require mounting between 7' and 10' above the sidewalk to maximize visibility. Technological equipment that is incongruous with the special character of the West End shall be located in areas of low visibility, be screened, or be located so that it is visually unobtrusive. (*Accessory Features: Structural and Mechanical Systems, West End Standards 2-4*)

Second: Ms. Shill

Vote:

For: Kaky Berry, Scott Binkley, Edwin Bouldin, Janet Shill, Tina Thacker, Nicole Townsend-Green
 Against: C. J. Idol, Noah Reynolds

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission deny application number COA2022-049 for work in the right-of-way at 888 West Fourth Street and 132 North Sunset Drive, Winston-Salem, within the West End Historic Overlay District.

Second: Ms. Thacker

Vote:

For: Kaky Berry, Scott Binkley, Edwin Bouldin, Janet Shill, Tina Thacker, Nicole Townsend-Green
 Against: C. J. Idol, Noah Reynolds

C. Kevin Hampton, Applicant
 814 West End Boulevard, Winston-Salem
 Plumly-Hanes House
 West End Historic Overlay District #377
Request: Installation of a pool, fence, and paving
COA2022-054

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to install a 35' x 15.5' in-ground pool in the side yard to the south of the house. The pool equipment will be installed next to the south wall of the house where it will be screened behind existing vegetation. While not a defined area of low visibility, the side yard is located at an elevation of 882', which is higher than the surrounding rights of way. West End Boulevard varies from 872-874' in elevation in front of the house. A high stone retaining wall at the back of the sidewalk supports the elevated house and yard, which is reached by a set of double steps. Forsyth Street is approximately 878' in elevation at the location of the pool; the stone retaining wall continues to support the elevated yard at the back of the sidewalk. Significant mature vegetation screens views to the location of the pool from the public rights of way. The pool will be located in the ground and below a direct line of sight, minimizing its visibility from the public rights of way. The installation of an in-ground pool in this screened and elevated location is not incongruous with the special character of the West End. (*Accessory Features: Commercial Trash Receptacles and Recreational Features*, West End Standard 2; *Accessory Features: Structural and Mechanical Systems*, West End Standard 1)
- 2) The applicant proposes to install a 4' high, black aluminum picket fence approximately 10' behind the existing retaining walls along West End Boulevard and Forsyth Street. The fence will be located behind the existing vegetation. The fence will turn back toward the house on West End Boulevard to connect to its southwest corner. A 6' high section of fence with a gate will run along the south side of the front porch to the corner of the house. A 4' high section of fence with a double gate will connect the southeast corner of the house to the outbuilding. Along Forsyth Street, the 4' high fence will turn north to connect to the southeast corner of the outbuilding. This fence will fully enclose the side yard as required by Code when a pool is constructed. The fence design, height, and level of transparency are appropriate for the location of the fence. It will not impede the view of the house from the right-of-way. Aluminum is an appropriate material for a fence adjacent to the street. The design of the fence minimizes its impact on the special character of the property and West End. (*Fences*, West End Standards 2-4)
- 3) The applicant proposes to pave a 20' x 40' area around the pool with a red concrete paver that mimics brick, which will match the existing pavers used for the driveway and parking area. Although it will connect to the driveway and parking area, a fence will prevent the new paved area from being used for car parking. The pavers will be laid in a herringbone pattern to match the pattern of existing paving on the property. The paved area will be located in the side yard behind the front façade of the house. Concrete pavers are an appropriate paving material, and the paving is compatible with the special character of the house and site. (*Decks, Terraces, and Patios*, West End Standards 2 and 3)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-054 located at 814 West End Boulevard (PIN 6825-75-1656), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The vegetative buffers along West End Boulevard and Forsyth Street shall be maintained to screen the pool for as long as a pool remains on the property in the side yard;
- 2) No commercial, contractor, or manufacturer signs shall be posted on the fence;
- 3) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 4) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 5) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Kevin Hampton, 814 West End Boulevard, Winston-Salem, owner.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Ms. Shill moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to install a 35' x 15.5' in-ground pool in the side yard to the south of the house. The pool equipment will be installed next to the south wall of the house where it will be screened behind existing vegetation. While not a defined area of low visibility, the side yard is located at an elevation of 882', which is higher than the surrounding rights of way. West End Boulevard varies from 872-874' in elevation in front of the house. A high stone retaining wall at the back of the sidewalk supports the elevated house and yard, which is reached by a set of double steps. Forsyth Street is approximately 878' in elevation at the location of the pool; the stone retaining wall continues to support the elevated yard at the back of the sidewalk. Significant mature vegetation screens views to the location of the pool from the public rights of way. The pool will be located in the ground and below a direct line of sight, minimizing its visibility from the public rights of way. The installation of an in-ground pool in this screened and elevated location is not incongruous with the special character of the West End. (*Accessory Features: Commercial Trash Receptacles and Recreational Features, West End Standard 2; Accessory Features: Structural and Mechanical Systems, West End Standard 1*)
- 2) The applicant proposes to install a 4' high, black aluminum picket fence approximately 10' behind the existing retaining walls along West End Boulevard and Forsyth Street. The fence will be located behind the existing vegetation. The fence will turn back toward the house on West End Boulevard to connect to its southwest corner. A 6' high section of fence with a gate will run along the south side of the front porch to the corner of the house. A 4' high section of fence with a double gate will connect the southeast corner of the house to the outbuilding. Along Forsyth Street, the 4' high fence will turn north to connect to the southeast corner of the outbuilding. This fence will fully enclose the side yard as required by Code when a pool is constructed. The fence design, height, and level of transparency are appropriate for the location of the fence. It will not impede the view of the house from the right-of-way. Aluminum is an appropriate material for a fence adjacent to the street. The design of the fence minimizes its impact on the special character of the property and West End. (*Fences, West End Standards 2-4*)
- 3) The applicant proposes to pave a 20' x 40' area around the pool with a red concrete paver that mimics brick, which will match the existing pavers used for the driveway and parking area. Although it will connect to the driveway and parking area, a fence will prevent the new paved area from being used for car parking. The pavers will be laid in a herringbone pattern to match the pattern of existing paving on the property. The paved area will be located in the side yard behind the front façade of the house. Concrete pavers are an appropriate paving material, and the paving is compatible with the special character of the house and site. (*Decks, Terraces, and Patios, West End Standards 2 and 3*)

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Idol moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2022-054 and grant a certificate of appropriateness for work at the Plumly-Hanes House located at 814 West End Boulevard, Winston-Salem, within the West End Historic Overlay District, subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The vegetative buffers along West End Boulevard and Forsyth Street shall be maintained to screen the pool for as long as a pool remains on the property in the side yard;
- 2) No commercial, contractor, or manufacturer signs shall be posted on the fence;
- 3) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 4) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and

- 5) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Binkley
Vote: Unanimous

D. Bud Clark, West End Renaissance Residence Development LLC, Applicant
207 Glade View Court, Winston-Salem
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: Construction of a house
COA2022-064

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to construct a single-family house on the lot at the corner of Glade Street and West End Boulevard. The setback, spacing, and orientation of the house on the lot are compatible with those of nearby buildings that contribute to the character of the West End. The site has already been partially graded and disturbance will be minimal. The site character, topography, and vistas and views will not be substantially altered. The site does not have any character-defining site features. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 1-3)
- 2) The 2 ½ story height, rectilinear form, hipped roof, and 3-bay width of the house are compatible in height, form, size, scale, massing, proportion, and roof shape with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. The doors and windows are arranged symmetrically with a central door flanked by banked two-over-one windows on the first floor and a central inset bay of two sets of paired two-over-one windows flanked by triple two-over-one windows on the second floor. The dormer uses a single triple window with diamond paned sashes. The sidewalls use an asymmetrical arrangement of banked and single two-over-one windows, which is typical for secondary facades. The spacing, placement, scale, orientation, proportion, and size of the window and door openings is compatible with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 4-5)
- 3) The proposed windows are aluminum clad wood windows with simulated divided light muntins that use permanently applied interior and exterior grilles. These window details are the same as those required for replacement windows on contributing structures in the West End. Diamond-pane and two-over-one windows are common throughout the West End. The proposed doors are constructed from wood in a French door style, which is found commonly in the West End. The material, proportion, pattern, and details of the windows and doors are compatible with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. (*New Construction*, West End Standard 6)
- 4) The proposed house will be clad with Pinehall Brick's Tidewater series in Barker House gray-brown finish, Certainteed Landmark series asphalt shingles, and painted, smooth finished Hardie Artisan lap siding on the sidewalls of the dormers. Painted Hardie fiber cement products will also be used for soffit and trim details. Porch railings with square balusters will be constructed from Perennial Wood, a treated Southern pine, and painted. Square, paired porch posts will be a resin and marble dust composite. Porch decking will be square-edge Trex in a gray finish. Garage doors will be steel with a factory-finished paint and glass windows. The light fixtures are designed in a Craftsman style with metal cages and frosted glass lanterns. The materials and finishes are compatible with, yet discernable from, historic materials and finishes found in surrounding historic buildings in terms of composition, scale, module, pattern, detail, texture, and finish. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 7-8)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-064 located at 207 Glade View Court (PIN 6825-76-5652), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;

- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Marty Marion, 780 Marshall Street, Winston-Salem, architect for applicant.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Ms. Thacker moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to construct a single-family house on the lot at the corner of Glade Street and West End Boulevard. The setback, spacing, and orientation of the house on the lot are compatible with those of nearby buildings that contribute to the character of the West End. The site has already been partially graded and disturbance will be minimal. The site character, topography, and vistas and views will not be substantially altered. The site does not have any character-defining site features. (*New Construction, West End Standards 1-3*)
- 2) The 2 ½ story height, rectilinear form, hipped roof, and 3-bay width of the house are compatible in height, form, size, scale, massing, proportion, and roof shape with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. The doors and windows are arranged symmetrically with a central door flanked by banked two-over-one windows on the first floor and a central inset bay of two sets of paired two-over-one windows flanked by triple two-over-one windows on the second floor. The dormer uses a single triple window with diamond paned sashes. The sidewalls use an asymmetrical arrangement of banked and single two-over-one windows, which is typical for secondary facades. The spacing, placement, scale, orientation, proportion, and size of the window and door openings is compatible with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. (*New Construction, West End Standards 4-5*)
- 3) The proposed windows are aluminum clad wood windows with simulated divided light muntins that use permanently applied interior and exterior grilles. These window details are the same as those required for replacement windows on contributing structures in the West End. Diamond-pane and two-over-one windows are common throughout the West End. The proposed doors are constructed from wood in a French door style, which is found commonly in the West End. The material, proportion, pattern, and details of the windows and doors are compatible with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. (*New Construction, West End Standard 6*)
- 4) The proposed house will be clad with Pinehall Brick's Tidewater series in Barker House gray-brown finish, Certainteed Landmark series asphalt shingles, and painted, smooth finished Hardie Artisan lap siding on the sidewalls of the dormers. Painted Hardie fiber cement products will also be used for soffit and trim details. Porch railings with square balusters will be constructed from Perennial Wood, a treated Southern pine, and painted. Square, paired porch posts will be a resin and marble dust composite. Porch decking will be square-edge Trex in a gray finish. Garage doors will be steel with a factory-finished paint and glass windows. The light fixtures are designed in a Craftsman style with metal cages and frosted glass lanterns. The materials and finishes are compatible with, yet discernable from, historic materials and finishes found in surrounding historic buildings in terms of composition, scale, module, pattern, detail, texture, and finish. (*New Construction, West End Standards 7-8*)

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Bouldin moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2022-064 for work at 207 Glade View Court, Winston-Salem, within the West End Historic Overlay District, subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Townsend-Green
Vote: Unanimous

E. Alisa Sprague, Applicant
230 North Sunset Drive, Winston-Salem
House
West End Historic Overlay District #400
**Request: Replacement of the side entrance stair and landing
COA2022-067**

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Finding

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the existing deteriorated and incongruous metal stair that connects the side door at the first floor of the house to the side yard. The metal stair runs along the side of the house and descends toward the front of the house. The applicant proposes to construct a new entrance stair and 8' x 12' landing from wood. The stair and landing will be supported on square wooden posts. The railings will be constructed with square posts and balusters and flat rails. The stairs will have kickboards. They will exit the back of the landing and descend to a 90 degree turn after which they will connect to the rear yard. The design of the replacement stair and landing is compatible with the style and character of the house. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 3)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding finding, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-067 located at 230 North Sunset Drive (PIN 6825-65-5973), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall paint the landing and stair to match the trim on the house within six (6) months after the completion of construction;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Alisa Sprague, 230 North Sunset Drive, Winston-Salem, owner.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Mr. Reynolds moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the existing deteriorated and incongruous metal stair that connects the side door at the first floor of the house to the side yard. The metal stair runs along the side of the house and descends toward the front of the house. The applicant proposes to construct a new entrance stair and 8' x 12' landing from wood. The stair and landing will be supported on square wooden posts. The railings will be constructed with square posts and balusters and flat rails. The stairs will have kickboards. They will exit the back of the landing and descend to a 90 degree turn after which they will connect to the rear yard. The design of the replacement stair and landing is compatible with the style and character of the house. (*Noncontributing Structures*, West End Standard 3)

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Reynolds moved that based on the preceding finding of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2022-067 for work at the House located at 230 North Sunset Drive, Winston-Salem, within the West End Historic Overlay District, subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall paint the landing and stair to match the trim on the house within six (6) months after the completion of construction;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 4) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

F. Hayes Wauford, Wilson Covington, Applicant
800 West End Boulevard, Winston-Salem
Glenn-Angelo-Walker House Servant's House
West End Historic Overlay District #374
**Request: Demolition of the Servant's House
COA2022-068**

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to demolish the Servant's House. Per the application, "the structure itself shows significant settling and deterioration. The floor system is 8 to 9 inches out of level in many locations. This is due to insufficient piers and termite damage and rot underneath the structure." The applicant has demonstrated that rehabilitation is

impractical. The applicant plans to salvage brick, beadboard, window sashes, and siding. The applicant will submit to the Historic Resources Commission photographs and as built drawings, including floor plans and elevations. (*Demolition, West End Standards 1 and 3*)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding finding, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-068 located at 800 West End Boulevard (PIN 6825-75-3848), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) Demolition shall be delayed for three hundred sixty-five (365) days or until the applicant has demonstrated to Commission staff compliance with the salvage and documentation requirements of the Standards, whichever comes first;
- 2) The applicant shall clear the lot of all construction debris and maintain it after demolition;
- 3) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 4) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 5) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Jamie Bowlin, Wilson-Covington, 2700 Boulder Park Court, Winston-Salem, applicant.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to demolish the Servant's House. Per the application, "the structure itself shows significant settling and deterioration. The floor system is 8 to 9 inches out of level in many locations. This is due to insufficient piers and termite damage and rot underneath the structure." The applicant has demonstrated that rehabilitation is impractical. The applicant plans to salvage brick, beadboard, window sashes, and siding. The applicant will submit to the Historic Resources Commission photographs and as built drawings, including floor plans and elevations. (*Demolition, West End Standards 1 and 3*)

Second: Ms. Thacker
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Thacker moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2022-068 for work at the Glenn-Angelo-Walker House Servant's House located at 800 West End Boulevard, Winston-Salem, within the West End Historic Overlay District, subject to the following conditions:

- 1) Demolition shall be delayed for three hundred sixty-five (365) days or until the applicant has demonstrated to Commission staff compliance with the salvage and documentation requirements of the Standards, whichever comes first;
- 2) The applicant shall clear the lot of all construction debris and maintain it after demolition;

- 3) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 4) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 5) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Shill
Vote: Unanimous

G. Hayes Wauford, Wilson Covington, Applicant
800 West End Boulevard, Winston-Salem
Glenn-Angelo-Walker House
West End Historic Overlay District #374
**Request: Construction of an outbuilding
COA2022-070**

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the deteriorated outbuilding with a new outbuilding using a design that is compatible with the special character of the property and West End. Like the historic outbuilding, the new outbuilding will combine a finished living space with an area for the storage of vehicles – a carport instead of a garage. The outbuilding will have a hipped roof clad with asphalt shingles, which is consistent with the roof form of the historic outbuilding and main house. Rafter tails will be exposed as they are on the historic outbuilding. The outbuilding will be sheathed with smooth Hardie plank siding with a 5" reveal to match the reveal dimension on the house and historic outbuilding. The foundation will be rock to match that of the house, and the carport floor will be concrete. (*Garages and Outbuildings, West End Standard 2; New Construction, West End Standard 7*)
- 2) The outbuilding will be constructed on the site of the former Servant's House, which is at the rear of the lot adjacent to the alley. This location is in an area of low visibility. Both the location and orientation of the proposed outbuilding are consistent with the historic relationship of garages and accessory buildings to the house and site. Construction will not require alteration of the site topography or any character-defining site features. (*Garages and Accessory Buildings, West End Standard 3; New Construction, West End Standards 1 and 2*)
- 3) The proposed outbuilding is similar in footprint to the size and scale of the historic outbuilding. The integrity of the house and open space of the lot will not be significantly reduced. The roofline is a single story in height, which is consistent with the height of the historic outbuilding and below the height of the principal structure. (*Garages and Accessory Buildings, West End Standard 4*)
- 4) The applicant proposes to install aluminum clad wooden four-over-four and six-light casement windows in living space. The windows will have simulated divided lights with permanently applied interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar. The window forms match double-hung and casement windows found in the house. The five panel and multi-light French doors are historic forms found throughout the West End. The spacing, placement, scale, orientation, proportion, and size of the window and door openings - and the material, pattern, and detail of the windows and doors - are compatible with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. (*New Construction, West End Standards 5 and 6*)
- 5) The outbuilding will be discernable from historic buildings in the West End because it will replicate historic forms in modern materials, including PVC trim details; simulated divided light, aluminum clad windows; and Hardie plank siding. (*New Construction, West End Standard 8*)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-070 located at 800 West End Boulevard (PIN 6825-75-3848), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Jamie Bowlin, Wilson-Covington, 2700 Boulder Park Court, Winston-Salem, applicant. Mr. Bowlin confirmed that the shutters and brick foundation shown on the drawings are erroneous; the foundation will be stone. Mr. Bowlin also confirmed that the retaining walls mentioned in the application will be brought forward as a separate application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Ms. Shill moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to replace the deteriorated outbuilding with a new outbuilding using a design that is compatible with the special character of the property and West End. Like the historic outbuilding, the new outbuilding will combine a finished living space with an area for the storage of vehicles – a carport instead of a garage. The outbuilding will have a hipped roof clad with asphalt shingles, which is consistent with the roof form of the historic outbuilding and main house. Rafter tails will be exposed as they are on the historic outbuilding. The outbuilding will be sheathed with smooth Hardie plank siding with a 5” reveal to match the reveal dimension on the house and historic outbuilding. The foundation will be rock to match that of the house, and the carport floor will be concrete. (*Garages and Outbuildings*, West End Standard 2; *New Construction*, West End Standard 7)
- 2) The outbuilding will be constructed on the site of the former Servant’s House, which is at the rear of the lot adjacent to the alley. This location is in an area of low visibility. Both the location and orientation of the proposed outbuilding are consistent with the historic relationship of garages and accessory buildings to the house and site. Construction will not require alteration of the site topography or any character-defining site features. (*Garages and Accessory Buildings*, West End Standard 3; *New Construction*, West End Standards 1 and 2)
- 3) The proposed outbuilding is similar in footprint to the size and scale of the historic outbuilding. The integrity of the house and open space of the lot will not be significantly reduced. The roofline is a single story in height, which is consistent with the height of the historic outbuilding and below the height of the principal structure. (*Garages and Accessory Buildings*, West End Standard 4)
- 4) The applicant proposes to install aluminum clad wooden four-over-four and six-light casement windows in living space. The windows will have simulated divided lights with permanently applied interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar. The window forms match double-hung and casement windows found in the house. The five panel and multi-light French doors are historic forms found throughout the West End. The spacing, placement, scale, orientation, proportion, and size of the window and door openings - and the material, pattern, and detail of the windows and doors - are compatible with surrounding buildings that contribute to the special character of the West End. (*New Construction*, West End Standards 5 and 6)

- 5) The outbuilding will be discernable from historic buildings in the West End because it will replicate historic forms in modern materials, including PVC trim details; simulated divided light, aluminum clad windows; and Hardie plank siding. (*New Construction, West End Standard 8*)

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Binkley moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2022-070 for work at the Glenn-Angelo-Walker House located at 800 West End Boulevard, within the West End Historic Overlay District, subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Reynolds
Vote: Unanimous

H. Hayes Wauford, Wilson Covington, Applicant
800 West End Boulevard, Winston-Salem
Glenn-Angelo-Walker House
West End Historic Overlay District #374
Request: Enclosure of a screened porch
COA2022-071

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to enclose the existing screened porch, which is a modern addition located in the rear yard. As a component of the project, a portion of the existing first floor exterior wall will be demolished to create an 11' 8" x 8' opening between the existing kitchen and new space. This addition is in an area of low visibility, and it cannot be seen from the street. There will not be any impact on the site topography or site features. The addition could be removed in the future without an impact to the form and integrity of the historic house. The addition is both more narrow and shorter than the historic house. It does not visually overpower the historic house. No highly visible character defining features of the house will be destroyed, damaged, obscured, or radically changed. (*Additions, West End Standards 1-3, 5-6*)
- 2) The applicant proposes to sheathe the addition in smooth Hardie plank with a 5" reveal to match the reveal of the house clapboards. New trim will be constructed from PVC to match the existing trim in size and detail. The applicant proposes to install aluminum clad wooden ten-light casement windows to match casement windows on the house. The windows will have simulated divided lights with permanently applied interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar. An eight-light French door with divided light sidelights and transom will be installed at the existing concrete stairs. The materials are compatible with the historic materials of the house but differentiated from them. (*Additions, West End Standard 4*)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-071 located at 800 West End Boulevard (PIN 6825-75-3848), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Jamie Bowlin, Wilson-Covington, 2700 Boulder Park Court, Winston-Salem, applicant.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Ms. Thacker moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to enclose the existing screened porch, which is a modern addition located in the rear yard. As a component of the project, a portion of the existing first floor exterior wall will be demolished to create an 11' 8" x 8' opening between the existing kitchen and new space. This addition is in an area of low visibility, and it cannot be seen from the street. There will not be any impact on the site topography or site features. The addition could be removed in the future without an impact to the form and integrity of the historic house. The addition is both more narrow and shorter than the historic house. It does not visually overpower the historic house. No highly visible character defining features of the house will be destroyed, damaged, obscured, or radically changed. (*Additions, West End Standards 1-3, 5-6*)
- 2) The applicant proposes to sheathe the addition in smooth Hardie plank with a 5" reveal to match the reveal of the house clapboards. New trim will be constructed from PVC to match the existing trim in size and detail. The applicant proposes to install aluminum clad wooden ten-light casement windows to match casement windows on the house. The windows will have simulated divided lights with permanently applied interior and exterior muntins and a spacer bar. An eight-light French door with divided light sidelights and transom will be installed at the existing concrete stairs. The materials are compatible with the historic materials of the house but differentiated from them. (*Additions, West End Standard 4*)

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Shill moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2022-071 for work at the Glenn-Angelo-Walker House located at 800 West End Boulevard, within the West End Historic Overlay District, subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Reynolds
Vote: Unanimous

III. MINOR WORK REPORT

No comments or questions on the Minor Work Report.

Chair Berry called a recess at 6:22 p.m. Chair Berry called the meeting back to order at 6:30 p.m.

IV. OTHER NOMINATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS

V. COMMITTEE REPORTS

A. Historic Marker Committee

Mr. Idol moved that the Commission establish *ex officio* seats on the Historic Marker Committee for a member of the African American Heritage Initiative and the Human Relations Commission.

Second: Mr. Reynolds

Vote: Unanimous

B. Education Committee

VI. STAFF REPORT

VII. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER