



**Minutes
Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission
September 7, 2022
4:00 p.m.
Bryce A. Stuart Municipal Building
Arnold G. King Public Meeting Room, 5th Floor
100 East First Street, Winston-Salem**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kaky Berry, Chair; C.J. Idol, Vice-Chair; Scott Binkley; Edwin Bouldin; Chad Gadberry; Emma Haney; Veronica Kromm; LeAnn Pegram; Noah Reynolds; Nicole Townsend-Green

MEMBERS ABSENT: Janet Shill; Tina Thacker

STAFF PRESENT: Heather Bratland; Michelle McCullough; David Reed
Deputy City Attorney Jerry Kontos

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of August 3, 2022, Minutes

MOTION by Mr. Idol to approve the August 3, 2022, minutes.

Second: Mr. Reynolds

Vote: Unanimous

B. Approval of July 27, 2022, Special Meeting Minutes

MOTION by Mr. Idol to approve the July 27, 2022, minutes.

Second: Mr. Reynolds

Vote: Unanimous

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

- A. Salem Congregation, Applicant
455 South Main Street, Winston-Salem
Belo House
Old Salem Historic District #35 & 36
**Request: After-the-fact installation of new HVAC system
COA2022-075**

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is incongruous with the character of the Old Salem Historic District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to install condenser units on the roof and run the linesets from these roof units over the top of the wall and gutters, down the wall, and through the mortar joints. Due to the elevation difference between the building and Church Street, the building site is approximately 15' lower than the intersection of Bank and Church Streets, and the height of the building, these visible linesets can be seen from Bank Street, Church Street, and Cedar Alley. The linesets alter the appearance of the building by adding a highly visible component of HVAC equipment. The size, location, and scale of the linesets, which project into the air and over the side of the building, detract from the character of the building and District: the linesets are not installed in the most unobtrusive manner possible. Outdoor mechanical equipment and HVAC units should be installed in areas where they will require the least possible alteration to the appearance of the structure and be hidden from public view. The size and scale of accessory features should not detract from the character of the building or District. (*Accessory Features*, Old Salem Standards 1, 5, and 9)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny COA2022-075 at the Belo House, located at 455 South Main Street, Winston-Salem (PIN 6835-23-9783).

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: David Bergstone, Salem Congregation, 501 South Main Street, Winston-Salem, applicant.

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application. Chair Berry reopened the public hearing at 4:20 p.m.

Public Comment

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: Molly Lineback, 455 South Main Street, #207, Winston-Salem, resident.

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing at 4:30 p.m. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Ms. Haney moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is incongruous with the character of the Old Salem Historic District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to install condenser units on the roof and run the linesets from these roof units over the top of the wall and gutters, down the wall, and through the mortar joints. Due to the elevation difference between the building and Church Street, the building site is approximately 15' lower than the intersection of Bank and Church Streets, and the height of the building, these visible linesets can be seen from Bank Street, Church Street, and Cedar Alley. The linesets alter the appearance of the building by adding a highly visible component of HVAC equipment. The size, location, and scale of the linesets, which project into the air and over the side of the building, detract from the character of the building and District: the linesets are not installed in the most unobtrusive manner possible. Outdoor mechanical equipment and HVAC units should be installed in areas where they will require the least possible alteration to the appearance of the structure and be hidden from public view. The size and scale of accessory features should not detract from the character of the building or District. (*Accessory Features*, Old Salem Standards 1, 5, and 9)

Second: Mr. Gadberry
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Idol moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission deny application number COA2022-075 for work at the Belo House located at 455 South Main Street Street, Winston-Salem, within the Old Salem Historic District.

Second: Ms. Haney
Vote: Unanimous

- B. Joe Bircher, Walter Robbs, Applicant
500 North Broad Street, Winston-Salem
(Former) Gas Station
West End Historic Overlay District #84
Request: Demolition of the building
COA2022-077

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to demolish the (Former) Gas Station, and N.C.G.S. §160D-949(a) prohibits denial of an application for a certificate of appropriateness authorizing the demolition of a building within the West End. Per the *West End Historic Overlay District Report*, the building post-dates the period of significance and does not contribute to the character of the West End. However, there is no documentation that establishes the estimated construction date of 1950, and a filling station was constructed on this site in 1929. Photographs show that several structures are wrapped within the brick façade and pent roof, including one that uses common construction techniques from the period of significance. (*Demolition*, West End Standards 2 and 3)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-079 at the (former) Filling Station, located at 500 North Broad Street (PIN 6825-97-4532), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) Demolition shall be delayed for three hundred sixty-five (365) days or until the applicant has submitted to Commission staff detailed photographic documentation of the interior and exterior of the structure with a focus on the northern structure, whichever comes first;
- 2) The applicant shall clear the lot of all construction debris and maintain it after demolition;
- 3) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 4) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 5) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Joe Bircher, Walter Robbs, 530 North Trade Street, Winston-Salem, applicant, and Paul Wollner, Augsburg Lutheran Church, 845 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem, owner.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: Jeff MacIntosh, 129 Woodbriar Road, Winston-Salem, Council Member for Northwest Ward.

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Mr. Idol moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to demolish the (Former) Gas Station, and N.C.G.S. §160D-949(a) prohibits denial of an application for a certificate of appropriateness authorizing the demolition of a building within the West End. Per the *West End Historic Overlay District Report*, the building post-dates the period of significance and does not contribute to the character of the West End. However, there is no documentation that establishes the estimated construction date of 1950, and a filling station was constructed on this site in 1929. Photographs show that several structures are wrapped within the brick façade and pent roof, including one that uses common construction techniques from the period of significance. (*Demolition*, West End Standards 2 and 3)

Second: Ms. Haney

Vote:

For: Kaky Berry; C.J. Idol; Scott Binkley; Edwin Bouldin; Emma Haney; Veronica Kromm; LeAnn Pegram; Noah Reynolds; Nicole Townsend-Green
 Against: None
 Abstention: Chad Gadberry

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Haney moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2022-075 and grant a certificate of appropriateness for work at the (former) Filling Station located at 500 North Broad Street (PIN 6825-97-4532), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions.

- 1) Demolition shall be delayed for three hundred sixty-five (365) days or until the applicant has submitted to Commission staff detailed photographic documentation of the interior and exterior of the structure with a focus on the northern structure, whichever comes first;
- 2) The applicant shall clear the lot of all construction debris and maintain it after demolition;
- 3) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 4) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 5) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Idol

Vote:

For: Kaky Berry; C.J. Idol; Scott Binkley; Edwin Bouldin; Emma Haney; Veronica Kromm; LeAnn Pegram; Noah Reynolds; Nicole Townsend-Green
 Against: None
 Abstention: Chad Gadberry

C. Keith Wales, Studio Wales, Applicant
 1012 Glade Street & 1001 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem
 Pilot Life Insurance Co. & Petree, Stockton and Robinson Law Offices
 West End Historic Overlay District #317 & #363
Request: Installation of a pergola and gazebo
COA2022-078

Staff Comments: Ms. Bratland presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to construct a gazebo and pergola as focal points in the open space adjacent to the intersection of West Fourth and Glade Streets. Both pergolas and gazebos have roots in the ancient world and were features found in nineteenth and twentieth century American gardens. The gazebo design references the unique and steeply pitched roofs found on the turrets of the Hotel Zinzendorf, which occupied this site in 1892. The pergola is based on the one located in Reynolda Gardens, which is contemporaneous with West End's period of significance. However, detailing is simplified as compared to historic models to differentiate the work as modern. The materials specified for the gazebo include red brick column bases; a brushed concrete floor; cast stone base caps; painted wood, fiber cement trim, and fiber reinforced plastic; and asphalt shingles. A metal lantern will hang from the ceiling. The pergola will be constructed from painted wood, fiber cement trim, and fiber reinforced plastic. These materials are compatible with historic materials and finishes in the West End in terms of scale, module,

pattern, detail, and texture but differentiated from historic materials in composition. (*Landscape Features*, West End Standard 3; *New Construction*, West End Standard 7 and 8)

- 2) The lawn and raised terrace where the pergola is to be located will be connected with a new set of curved granite steps. Brick site walls with cast stone caps will be installed at the head of the lawn on either side of the granite steps to create a focal point at the pergola and terminate the view. This treatment references the low walls at the pergola in Reynolda Gardens, and the site wall design will match existing site walls at the western end of the lawn. The walls are compatible with the site in terms of setback, size, scale, and height. Next to the site walls, new concrete steps will navigate the small rise from the lawn and connect the sidewalks that encircle the lawn to new concrete sidewalks that will provide accessible paths to the area under the pergola. All materials are appropriate for hardscaping in the West End and will match the existing materials at the lawn. (*Walkways and Steps*, West End Standards 4 and 5; *Retaining and Other Landscaping Walls*, West End Standards 4, 5, and 7)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-078 located at 1012 Glade Street (PIN 6825-76-9375) and 1001 West Fourth Street (PIN 6825-76-8026), within the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Mark Boynton, Kilpatrick Townsend, 1001 West Fourth Street, Winston-Salem, owner; and Keith Wales, Studio Wales, 3151 Milhaven Lake Drive, Winston-Salem, architect.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Ms. Pegram moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to construct a gazebo and pergola as focal points in the open space adjacent to the intersection of West Fourth and Glade Streets. Both pergolas and gazebos have roots in the ancient world and were features found in nineteenth and twentieth century American gardens. The gazebo design references the unique and steeply pitched roofs found on the turrets of the Hotel Zinzendorf, which occupied this site in 1892. The pergola is based on the one located in Reynolda Gardens, which is contemporaneous with West End's period of significance. However, detailing is simplified as compared to historic models to differentiate the work as modern. The materials specified for the gazebo include red brick column bases; a brushed concrete floor; cast stone base caps; painted wood, fiber cement trim, and fiber reinforced plastic; and asphalt shingles. A metal lantern will hang from the ceiling. The pergola will be constructed from painted wood, fiber cement trim, and fiber reinforced plastic. These materials are compatible with historic materials and finishes in the West End in terms of scale, module, pattern, detail, and texture but differentiated from historic materials in composition. (*Landscape Features*, West End Standard 3; *New Construction*, West End Standard 7 and 8)
- 2) The lawn and raised terrace where the pergola is to be located will be connected with a new set of curved granite steps. Brick site walls with cast stone caps will be installed at the head of the lawn on either side of the granite steps to create a focal point at the pergola and terminate the view. This treatment references the low walls at the pergola in Reynolda Gardens, and the site wall design will match existing site walls at the western end of the lawn. The

walls are compatible with the site in terms of setback, size, scale, and height. Next to the site walls, new concrete steps will navigate the small rise from the lawn and connect the sidewalks that encircle the lawn to new concrete sidewalks that will provide accessible paths to the area under the pergola. All materials are appropriate for hardscaping in the West End and will match the existing materials at the lawn. (*Walkways and Steps*, West End Standards 4 and 5; *Retaining and Other Landscaping Walls*, West End Standards 4, 5, and 7)

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Kromm moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2022-078 and grant a certificate of appropriateness for work at the Pilot Life Insurance Co. located at 1012 Glade Street (PIN 6825-76-9375) and the Petree, Stockton and Robinson Law Offices located at 1001 West Fourth Street (PIN 6825-76-8026), within the West End Historic Overlay District, subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Mr. Gadberry
Vote: Unanimous

- D. Hollie Burgess, Applicant
633 North Liberty Street, Winston-Salem
Twin City Motor Company Building
Local Historic Landmark #142
**Request: After-the-fact installation of HVAC/mechanical equipment and screening
COA2022-080**

Staff Comments: Ms. McCullough presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Staff Findings

Commission staff finds that the project is not incongruous with the character of the Local Historic Landmark because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to move the HVAC and mechanical equipment from the roof to the southeast corner adjacent to the building and Main Street. Due to its location in the City center, the building has three street fronting elevations and one elevation facing a surface parking area, therefore making all four sides highly visible. The location selected to house the HVAC and mechanical equipment is on the south side of the building. The south and east elevations are the least prominent because they were the more utilitarian and nondecorative elevations of the building. The south elevation is the only one that was left unfinished, exposing the concrete frame and brick infill. The front and/or highly decorative elevations of the building face Liberty and Seventh Streets. Therefore, this is the most unobtrusive location for new HVAC and mechanical equipment that is necessary for the new uses. The mechanical equipment will not compromise the overall historic character of the Landmark building or site. (*Utilities and Energy Retrofit*, Landmark Standards 6 and 7; *Site Features and Plantings*, Landmark Standard 8)
- 2) The HVAC and mechanical equipment are proposed to be screened from view with two different styles of fencing. The screening fence around the HVAC units on the southeast corner adjacent to the building and Main Street will be constructed of black steel columns with stained wood panels between. A black silhouette of the Winston-Salem skyline with a stained wood Model T Ford will be added to all three sides of the screening. The fence will measure 38.54' wide x 30' deep x 6' high. Each side will have four columns and three sections of wood paneling. The south panel will have a gate made of the same material and same dimensions as the other portion of the screening. There will also be screening of mechanical equipment located at the center of the south elevation. The screening fence

will be black steel columns with shrubs planted between the columns. The screening will be 10' wide x 20' deep x 6' high. The screening will minimize the visual impact of the HVAC and mechanical equipment. The screening fences are located and configured so that they are compatible with the landmark building and site. They will not obscure, damage, or destroy any significant building or structural features. (*Utilities and Energy Retrofit*, Landmark Standard 6 and *Fences and Walls*, Landmark Standard 7)

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve COA2022-080 located at 633 North Liberty Street (PIN 6835-28-2505), the Twin City Motor Company Building, Local Historic Landmark #142, with the following conditions:

- 1) All existing chain link fencing shall be removed, and the new screening shall be constructed within 60 days of issuance of the COA;
- 2) No commercial, contractor, or manufacturer signs shall be posted on the screening;
- 3) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 4) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 5) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Simon Burgess, 102 West Third Street, Suite 725, Winston-Salem, owner.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

Chair Berry closed the public hearing. The Commission discussed the application.

Commission Findings of Fact

Ms. Pegram moved that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the Local Historic Landmark #142 because:

- 1) The applicant proposes to move the HVAC and mechanical equipment from the roof to the southeast corner adjacent to the building and Main Street. Due to its location in the City center, the building has three street fronting elevations and one elevation facing a surface parking area, therefore making all four sides highly visible. The location selected to house the HVAC and mechanical equipment is on the south side of the building. The south and east elevations are the least prominent because they were the more utilitarian and nondescriptive elevations of the building. The south elevation is the only one that was left unfinished, exposing the concrete frame and brick infill. The front and/or highly decorative elevations of the building face Liberty and Seventh Streets. Therefore, this is the most unobtrusive location for new HVAC and mechanical equipment that is necessary for the new uses. The mechanical equipment will not compromise the overall historic character of the Landmark building or site. (*Utilities and Energy Retrofit*, Landmark Standards 6 and 7; *Site Features and Plantings*, Landmark Standard 8)
- 2) The HVAC and mechanical equipment are proposed to be screened from view with two different styles of fencing. The screening fence around the HVAC units on the southeast corner adjacent to the building and Main Street will be constructed of black steel columns with stained wood panels between. A black silhouette of the Winston-Salem skyline with a stained wood Model T Ford will be added to all three sides of the screening. The fence will measure 38.54' wide x 30' deep x 6' high. Each side will have four columns and three sections of wood paneling. The south panel will have a gate made of the same material and same dimensions as the other portion of the screening. There will also be screening of mechanical equipment located at the center of the south elevation. The screening fence will be black steel columns with shrubs planted between the columns. The screening will be 10' wide x 20' deep x 6' high. The screening will minimize the visual impact of the HVAC and mechanical equipment. The screening fences

are located and configured so that they are compatible with the landmark building and site. They will not obscure, damage, or destroy any significant building or structural features. (*Utilities and Energy Retrofit*, Landmark Standard 6 and *Fences and Walls*, Landmark Standard 7)

Second: Ms. Haney
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Ms. Haney moved that based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2022-080 for work at 633 North Liberty Street (PIN 6835-28-2505), the Twin City Motor Company Building, Local Historic Landmark #142, subject to the following conditions:

- 1) All existing chain link fencing shall be removed, and the new screening shall be constructed within 60 days of issuance of the COA;
- 2) No commercial, contractor, or manufacturer signs shall be posted on the screening;
- 3) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 4) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 5) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Second: Ms. Pegram
Vote: Unanimous

III. **MINOR WORK REPORT**

No comments or questions on the Minor Work Report.

IV. **OTHER NOMINATIONS/PUBLIC HEARINGS**

- A. National Register Nomination Review
Downtown Winston-Salem Historic District

Kayla Halberg, Commonwealth Preservation Group, presented a map of the historic district and discussed the themes under which the district is being nominated to the National Register of Historic Places. Members of the public were given the opportunity to make comments on the nomination.

MOTION by Mr. Idol to recommend that City Council find that the Downtown Winston-Salem Historic District meets the criteria for listing in the National Register.

Second: Ms. Kromm
Vote: Unanimous

V. **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

- A. Historic Marker Committee

1. Robert Leak III, *ex officio* member from the Human Relations Commission
2. Annette Wilson, *ex officio* member from the African American Heritage Initiative Committee
3. Set dates for criteria assessment and annual application review meetings by email

- B. Education Committee

1. Preservation North Carolina Conference registration and volunteer confirmation

VI. STAFF REPORT

A. Retreat follow up

1. Downtown Plan recommendations

MOTION by Mr. Reynolds to approve the Downtown Plan recommendations presented at the HRC retreat with the edit suggested by Mr. Idol.

Second: Mr. Idol
Vote: Unanimous

2. Formation of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Committee will be done after the Committee guiding documents are drafted

B. FY2021 CLG Report & Response

C. Request to reschedule April 5, 2023, HRC meeting to April 12, 2023

MOTION by Ms. Pegram to approve the calendar revision.

Second: Mr. Bouldin
Vote: Unanimous

D. School of Government training for preservation commissions on December 1

Ms. Berry, Mr. Bouldin, Ms. Haney, Mr. Idol, Ms. Kromm, Ms. Pegram, Mr. Reynolds, and Ms. Townsend-Green are interested in attending.

VII. FOR THE GOOD OF THE ORDER