

RECEIVED

MAR - 4 2021

NORTH CAROLINA )  
 )  
FORSYTH COUNTY)

FORSYTH COUNTY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

ORDER )  
 )  
 )

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

CASE NUMBER COA2021-010

On March 3, 2021, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission (“Commission”) conducted, in the above referenced matter, a public hearing in accordance with the statutes and case law pertaining to quasi-judicial proceedings for the issuance of certificates of appropriateness. During the hearing, Heather Bratland, Historic Resources Officer, presented the staff report, findings, and recommendation. Jim Vaughan, representative of the property owner, appeared to present testimony and evidence in support of the application. No one appeared to present testimony and evidence in opposition to the application.

After presentation of all testimony and evidence, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the hearing, finds that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District because:

- 1) The applicant has provided evidence to show that it is not feasible to repair the slate roof or replace it with slate because of the “unavailability of skilled craftsmen.” Per the applicant:

*After a series of serious leaks, in 2017 ... trying to get a local roofing company ... to return a phone call was next to impossible. Every company we spoke with refused to deal with a slate roof. We hired a contractor out of Greensboro who claimed to have experience working with slate roof repair and replacement to do the partial roof on the right side in 2018-2019. We were able to locate slate from the Virginia Slate Company in Richmond, Va. Pennsylvania slate was no longer available .... The job was not done properly, the slate was improperly installed is now not salvageable. After firing the incompetent contractor, I learned that Preferred Roofing might handle slate roofs. I attempted to contact Preferred Roofing on numerous occasions, leaving several messages in November and December 2020. My calls were not returned. I also reached out to Angie’s List which was a complete joke. I specifically indicated that I needed a roofing company with slate experience. Despite being told that “We’ve matched pros to your Natural Slate Roof Install project,” that was not the case. The first company I called wanted me to file an insurance claim before they would talk to me. (J.W. Arnold Commercial and Residential Roofing LLC.) I left messages with three additional companies asking for someone to call me about a slate roof replacement and never got a return phone call. It is clear that there are very few, if any, roofers who want to work on a slate roof replacement. Under the circumstances, it is not feasible for us to find a skilled craftsman who could replace the slate roof. I have no confidence that there are any reputable roofing contractors with slate experience that will be willing tackle this job. A significant portion of the underlying sheeting, the valleys, hips and all flashing will need to be replaced. In addition, we need to repair the eaves on the left side and in the front of the house. Moving to an alternative material will provide us with more options for reputable roofing contractor and ease of repairs as we head into the future.*

(Roofs, West End Standard 4; Appendix A-Glossary of Terms, West End Feasibility Circumstance 2)

RECEIVED

MAR - 4 2021

- 2) The applicant proposes to replace the slate with CertainTeed Grand Manor shingles and install new copper flashing at the valleys, chimneys, and drip edges. The multi-layered asphalt shingles create shadows and convey the three-dimensional appearance of slate. The Restoration Branch of the State Historic Preservation Office has approved the use of these shingles on a state-owned historic house, and the National Park Service has approved their use at a rehabilitation tax credit project in Raleigh. The deteriorated metal ridgeline details and finials will be recreated to match the existing features. (*Roofs*, West End Standards 1, 3, and 4)

Based on the preceding findings, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission hereby approves COA2021-010 at 1101 West Fourth Street, within the West End Historic Overlay District (PIN 6825-75-6920.00), with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

This the fourth day of March, 2021.



---

Kevin G. Owen, Chair  
Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission

# CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Date: March 3, 2021

CASE #: COA2021-010

On March 3, 2021, the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission approved the issuance of this Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) on the application for the following work at the O'Hanlon-Joyce House, located at 1101 West Fourth Street in the West End Historic Overlay District.

- **Replacement of the slate roof with CertainTeed Highland Slate Designer Shingles**

Approval of this item was granted subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, which qualify as minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project; and,
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

This COA runs with the property upon which the work is to be performed. The COA does not serve in any manner as a certification by the HRC or the Winston-Salem/Forsyth County Planning Division that the applicant or anyone else has the authority to be on the subject property to perform the approved work. You should perform your own due diligence to confirm whether you have the legal authority to be on the property to perform the approved work.

This Certificate of Appropriateness expires on March 3, 2024.



---

Kevin G. Owen, Chair  
Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission

*The scope of work for this project must meet all other applicable building codes and ordinances. Any additional approvals or permits from the City must be obtained prior to initiating work.*